

The Old Testament Background of Paul's Reference to "the Fruit of the Spirit" in Galatians 5:22

G. K. BEALE
WHEATON COLLEGE GRADUATE SCHOOL

"The fruit of the Spirit" in Gal 5:22 and its manifestations appear to be a general allusion to Isaiah's promise that the Spirit would bring about abundant fertility in the coming new age. Uppermost in mind are Isaiah's repeated prophecies (especially chap. 32 and, above all, 57) that in the new creation the Spirit would be the bearer of plentiful fruitfulness, which Isaiah often interprets to be godly attributes such as righteousness, patience, peace, joy, holiness, and trust in the Lord, traits either identical or quite similar to those in Gal 5:22-23. Paul's rhetorical effect and thematic emphasis are increased by the readers' being able to situate themselves as those who are part of the dawning eschatological promises made to Israel, and hence they are true Israelites who play a significant role in this cosmic redemptive-historical drama. If they are really part of this drama, then they will pay heed to Paul's exhortations.

Key Words: fruit, Spirit, inaugurated eschatology, new creation, Isaiah 32 and 57, Galatians 5, Septuagint

In Gal 5:22 Paul refers to "the fruit of the Spirit" and then enumerates several examples of these fruits (e.g., "love, joy, peace, patience," etc.) in vv. 22b-23. Though past commentators have not seen any OT or Jewish background for this famous reference, recently some have proposed such a background. G. W. Hansen has proposed that Isaiah and a few other OT passages form the background. In adducing a reference to Isa 32:15-17 and Joel 2:28-32, Hansen says, "the promise of the Spirit and the promise of moral fruitfulness in God's people are

Author's note: I am grateful to my students Todd Wilson, Ben Gladd, and Chris Beetham for their reading of this manuscript and for helpful suggestions. I am also grateful for the comments received as a result of reading earlier drafts of this paper at the "Pauline Epistles" section of SIM. (2001 annual meeting) and at the "NT Section" of the Tyndale Fellowship for Biblical Studies (2004 annual meeting).

connected in the Old Testament," and the reference in Gal 5:22 "is probably drawn from the imagery of the Old Testament."¹ Also briefly, and almost identically, J. M. G. Barclay has made the same claim, though with a little more emphasis on Isaiah 32.² In addition, J. D. G. Dunn has suggested with respect to Gal 5:22 that, "if Paul intended to invoke the imagery of fruit-bearing Israel (classically Isa. V.1-7), his point would be that the fruit for which God looked in Israel was being produced (only) by those (Galatian Gentiles included) who walked by the Spirit."³ S. C. Keesmaat locates the background more generally in the covenant blessings of Leviticus and Deuteronomy (e.g., Lev 26:4; Deut 7:12-17), as well as the promises of restoration in the prophets, wherein fruitfulness for Israel is foreseen.⁴ Most recently, Moises Silva has proposed that Paul's "reference to the fruit of the Spirit (especially peace) in Gal 5:22 appears to derive from Isa 32:14-15."⁵

Beyond these five brief comments, standard commentaries on Galatians and other related literature, as far as I have surveyed, have not proposed an OT background for "the fruit of the Spirit" (e.g., cf. Betz, Matera, etc.). Nevertheless, the recent proposals that have been adduced have been made only in a mere "passing" manner, and there has been no attempt to substantiate the suggestions. Indeed, as they stand, the proposals remain in the realm of speculation. For example, each of the OT passages proposed as background either mention only the "Spirit" and does not actually include an explicit reference to "fruit" (in the LXX [icaprOg] or MT),⁶ or references to both the "Spirit" and "fruit" are missing (e.g., in Isa 5:1-7, though, as in Isaiah 32, the concept of "fruit" is connoted).⁷

1. *Galatians* (InterVarsity Press NT Commentary; Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 1994), 178.

2. *Obedying the Truth: A Study of Paul's Ethics in Galatians* (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1988), 121. In addition, he cites Isa 5:1-7, 27:2-6, and 37:30-32 in more distant connection, along with a number of other OT passages outside of Isaiah that he "presumes" formed collective imagery with which "Paul was familiar."

3. *The Epistle to the Galatians* (NTC; Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1993), 308. See also a similarly brief proposal in my "Eschatological Conception of New Testament Theology," in *"The Reader Must Understand": Eschatology in the Bible and Theology* (ed. K. E. Brower and M. W. Elliott; Leicester: Apollo [Inter-Varsity Press], 1997), 31, adducing Isa 11:1-5; 32:13-18; 44:2-4; 61:3, 11; 65:17-22.

4. Keesmaat, *Paul and His Story* (JSNTSup 181; Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999), 207-8; for the hope in the prophets, she cites primarily Isa 27:6; Jer 38[31]:12; Ezek 17:23; 34:27; 36:8; Amos 9:14; Zech 8:12. With respect to the Deuteronomy background, see also C. M. Pate, *The Reverse of the Curse* (WUNT 2/114; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2000), 229-30.

5. "Galatians and Philippians," in *A Commentary on the Use of the Old Testament in the New Testament* (ed. G. K. Beale and D. A. Carson; Grand Rapids: Baker, forthcoming).

6. The concept of "fruit" does occur in the Isaiah 32 passage.

7. Though MS 91 of the Isa 5:7 LXX includes a variant reading of "I expected it [the 'plant' of Israel] to make fruit [καρπός] instead of "I expected it [the 'plant' of Israel] to make judgment."

The purpose of this article is to explore whether or not the "intuition" of these recent commentators is correct, though other passages in Isaiah than those already proposed will be primarily adduced and analyzed to consider this point. In particular, we will contend that "the fruit of the Spirit" in Gal 5:22 and its manifestations appear to be a general allusion to Isaiah's promise that the Spirit would bring about abundant fertility in the coming new age. We will argue that uppermost in mind are Isaiah's repeated prophecies (chap. 32 and especially 57) that in the new creation the Spirit would be the bearer of plentiful fruitfulness, which Isaiah often interprets to be godly attributes such as righteousness, patience, peace, joy, holiness, and trust in the Lord, traits either identical or quite similar to those in Gal 5:22-23.

A strategy throughout this essay will be to adduce several lines of evidence in favor of the proposal that parts of Isaiah stand behind Paul's well-known "fruit of the Spirit" passage. Some of the evidence will be stronger than others, but when all of the relevant material is viewed as a whole, the less convincing material should become more significant than when seen by itself. Thus, some arguments in favor of this OT background may not stand on their own but are intended to take on more persuasive power when viewed in light of the other angles of reasoning. Therefore, the contention will be that the *overall weight* of the cumulative arguments points to the plausibility or probability of Isaiah's being the OT backdrop for best understanding Gal 5:22.

THE ISAIANIC ESCHATOLOGICAL NEW CREATION BACKGROUND OF "THE FRUIT OF THE SPIRIT" IN GALATIANS 5:22-23

First, we look at the OT background and then the relevant Jewish material.

The Old Testament Background, Especially in the Septuagint

We begin with a passage mentioned by Hansen, Barclay, and Silva, which, we think, is merely "the tip of the iceberg": Isa 32:15-18 says,

15 Until the Spirit is poured out upon us from on high,
And the wilderness becomes a fertile field
And the fertile field is considered as a forest.
16 Then justice will dwell in the wilderness,
And righteousness will abide in the fertile field.
17 And the task of righteousness will be peace,
And the work of righteousness, quietness and confidence forever.
18 Then my people will live in a peaceful habitation.
And in secure dwellings and in undisturbed resting places.

In contrast to the land's unfruitful condition (Isa 32:10-14), in the coming restoration, the Spirit will come upon Israel and create abundant Fertility (v. 15). However, this fertility appears to go beyond mere material abundance and includes spiritual fecundity: not only will the Spirit create literal plants, crops, and trees in the field but also the spirit will produce spiritual fruits in the fields: "justice will dwell in the wilderness, and righteousness will abide in the fertile field" (v. 16). The "task" and "work" (which is presumably viewed as being performed by God's Spirits in the "fertile field"; cf. v. 16) resulting in "righteousness" will also produce "peace," "quietness," and confidence" (v. 17). Thus, the traits mentioned in vv. 17-18 appear to be additional by-products of the Spirit's cultivating work. Both the Septuagint and MT make these essential points.

Likewise, other texts in the Septuagintal version of Isaiah make the same connection and sometimes exhibit an even closer or more explicit link between the eschatological pouring out of the Spirit and the figurative fruits of godly characteristics. The closest such parallel is Isa 57:15-19, which appears to be a development of 32:15-18, especially in the LXX:

Isaiah 32 (LXX)	Isaiah 57 (LXX)
32:15 ἕως ἄν ἐπέλθῃ ἐφ' ὑμᾶς Πνεῦμα ἀφ' ὑψηλοῦ Until the Spirit from on high Should come upon you.	57:15-16 ὁ ὑψιστος ὁ ἐν ὑψηλοῖς τὸν Αἰῶνα ἅγιος ἐν ἀγίοις ὄνομα αὐτοῦ <u>κύριος ὑψισ-</u> <u>τος ἐν ἀγίοις</u> ναπαυόμενος ... <u>πνεῦμα γὰρ</u> <u>παρ' ἐμοῦ ἐξελεύσεται</u> , καὶ πνοὴν πᾶσαν ἐγὼ ἐποίησα <u>the most high who dwells in the heights</u> for eternity, Holy in the holies is his name, the Lord <u>Most High</u> who rests in the holies... <u>for the Spirit will come forth from me</u> , and I [will] have created all breath (see below for translation of the final ἐποίησα

That the LXX of Isa 57:16 probably has the divine Spirit in mind, not the human spirit or a vague divine influence, is suggested not only by

8. The combined Hebrew words for "task" (**מעשה**) and "work" (**עבודה**) occur only elsewhere in Isaiah at 28:21, where God is the subject of the activity (see also 2 Chr 31:21 for the combination). The two words sometimes describe agricultural work in the OT (e.g., cf. **עבודה** in Ps 104:14); of particular significance in this respect, especially for the imagery of Isa 32:16-18, is the use of **מעשה** in Isa 60:21: "Then all your people will be righteous; they will possess the land forever, the branch of My planting, the work of My hands." Here the righteousness of Israel is called "the branch," which is the result of God's spiritual work of cultivation (i.e., "the branch" resulting from "My planting," on which see likewise Isa 61:3b).

early Jewish and patristic exegetical tradition and the different language used by the Septuagintal version,⁹ but also by the following similarities to Isa 32:15-17. These would be the only two passages in Isaiah that affirm that during Israel's future restoration God's "Spirit (mvet4ta) will come" to enrich the nation, though there are a few other passages in the book that mention the "Spirit" in this more general connection (the anarthrous πνεῦμα in Isa 57:16 does not imply a reference to human spirit, since it is also anarthrous in 32:15, which actually is another common feature of both texts¹⁰). Furthermore, these are the only passages in the OT where the Spirit comes from on "high" (ὕψηλός)¹¹ and results in the creation of figurative or spiritual fruits in God's people. In Isaiah 32, "righteousness," "peace," and "confidence" are produced (32:17), while "patience" and "peace" occur among the people in Isaiah 57 (57:15, 19 of LXX). The two passages even mention "peace" twice to describe the new spiritually fertile conditions.¹² In addition, both texts imply that "joy" will also be a characteristic of the restored nation by underscoring that "joy" will be lacking for those in an unrestored condition (cf. εὐφροσύνη in Isa 32:13 and χαίρειν in 57:21). A further link between the two Isaiah passages lies in the common idea of end-time "rest." Isa 32:18 affirms that restored Israel "will inhabit a city of peace . . . and they will rest [ἀναπαύσονται] with wealth," while Isa 57:19-20 says that, in contrast to the "peace" of

9. See the excursus at the end of the article for all of these points.

10. Indeed, when God's Spirit is referred to, the LXX translator sometimes uses the article (about 8x) and sometimes does not (about 7x); strikingly, the human spirit is usually accompanied by an article (19:3; 26:9; 33:11; 38:12), though once is without it (42:5).

11. Isa 63:14 also points to itvci4iu in 57:16 being the divine Spirit: at Israel's first exodus, "the Spirit came down from the Lord [κατέβη πνεῦμα παρὰ κυρίου] and guided them," wording strikingly close to 57:16b (πνεῦμα...παρ' ἐμοῦ ἐξελεύσεται; note also MT and Aquila have "I will guide him" in 57:18 following the descent of the "Spirit" in v. 16). Isa 63:14 is part of a plea that God act again as he did in the first exodus in a coming end-time restoration, which reaches partial climax with "turn from heaven and look from your holy house" (63:15) and "if you would open heaven ... at your presence the nations will be troubled" (64:1-3; MT reads, "O that you would rend the heavens and come down"; Tana Debe Eliyyahu, ER p. 156 adduces Isa 64:1. ff. to support the notion that just as Israel's experiences in exile were like those in Egyptian bondage, so would their "redemption" be sure to come, as it did at the Exodus). Similarly, Isa 30:27-28 (LXX) interprets the MT's apparent reference to God's "breath" (רוּחַ) to be God's Spirit, since it also interprets the MT's reference to "lips" and "tongue" as God's "word": "and his Spirit, as rushing water in a valley, will come [ἴξει] as far as the neck, and be divided, to confound the nations for vain error." The MT of Isa 30:27 also says God "comes from a remote place" (i.e., high heavens).

12. The MT also has שָׁלוֹם in 57:18, which, even though in the Piel, may well include a nuance of "peace," which it can carry in the Qal, Hiphil, and Hophal forms (on which, see EIALOT 1533-36), thus intensifying and anticipating the double reference to the noun form "peace" (שָׁלוֹם) in 57:19.

God's restored people given to them by the God who "rests" in the heavenly temple (v. 15), "the unrighteous ... will not be able to rest" (ἀναπαύσασθαι).

These links suggest that Isa 32:15ff. and 57:15-19 were literarily connected by the hand of the LXX translator himself, which is further pointed to by evidence that Isa 57:16 also is intentionally connected by the same translator (or subsequent reviser) to another, earlier Isaiah passage not far from chap. 32 (in 28:28),¹³ a methodological observation that can be made in other instances in the book.¹⁴

Though the word "fruit" does not appear in I.sa 32:15-18, the concept does (though more clearly in the MT and Targum).¹⁵ On the other hand, Isa 57:15-19 explicitly mentions "fruit" (v. 19) in the MT (נוֹרָה) and, especially, in various significant versions of the LXX (καρπός).

*The Relation of the Septuagintal Background,
Especially Isaiah 57, to Galatians 5:22*

This last point about "fruit" in Isaiah 57 merits elaboration. While the eclectic text of J. Ziegler's Göttingen Septuagint does not include καρπός, omitting the concluding clause of v. 18b of the MT ("and to his mourners") and the introductory phrase of v. 19a ("creating the fruit of the lips"), his apparatus reveals that the versions of Aquila, Symmachus, and Theodotion include the omitted segments of the MT, including reference to "fruit" (καρπός). Aquila and Symmachus read "and I gave to him true comfort [and] for his mourners, (I am the one) creating fruit [καὶ] τοῖς πενθοῦσιν αὐτοῦ, κτιζῶν καρποῦ]: peace upon peace to them that are far off and to them that are near." Theodotion, on the other hand, has essentially the same wording as the MT (the Greek rendering of which in v. 19a is "the one creating the *fruit* [καρπός] of the lips: peace upon peace" (so also V/I' [MSS of the Lucianic subgroup]-86c-233 544 Tht).

The upshot of these variants especially in Aquila and Symmachus, as well as Theodotion and its allies together with the mainline

13. See I. L. Seeligmann, *The Septuagint Version of Isaiah* (Mededelingen en Verhandelingen 9; Leiden: Brill, 1948), 70-71, who argues that the phrase οὐ γὰρ εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα ἐγὼ ὑμῖν ὀργισθήσομαι in Isa 28:28 was influenced by the wording of 57:16 (οὐκ εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα ἐκδικήσω ὑμᾶς οὐδὲ διὰ παντὸς ὀργισθήσομαι ὑμῖν); note also the similarity of παρά κυρίου σαβαωθ ἐχλήθην in 28:29 with παρ' ἐμοῦ ἐξελεύσεται in 57:16 (the verb in 28:29 probably has a prophetic perfect sense with a future notion, since it translates an imperfect Hebrew form and the context supports a future sense). He argues similarly with respect to Isa 57:11 in relation to 51:12.

14. *Ibid.*, 71.

15. Significantly though, Jas 3:18 likely makes allusion to Isa 32:17 and in doing so explicitly mentions "fruit" ("and the fruit of righteousness is sown in peace for those making peace").

LXX text, is that we have a passage in the early Septuagintal textual tradition of Isaiah in which God prophesies that he will send his Spirit (πνεῦμα) (57:16b, LXX)¹⁶ to produce spiritual fruit (καρπός) in the godly, which in the immediate context is directly construed to be the fruit of "peace" (εἰρήνη [2x] v. 19), and the by-products of "patience" (μακροθυμία, v. 15)¹⁷ and "joy" (χαίρειν in 57:21) among his restored people.¹⁸ Others perhaps have not noticed the possibility of this background because of not focusing on the potential significance of the variant LXX traditions in this passage and not perceiving that this is one of the most highly charged eschatological "Spirit" passages in all of the Septuagint of Isaiah, as we have labored to argue above (which is expanded in the appended excursus).

The Septuagintal reading of "fruit" in Isaiah 57 probably existed before and during Paul's time,¹⁹ and, together with the words surrounding it, may now be seen as, at least, part of the likely quarry

16. See the appended excursus for fuller discussion of the variants in Isa 57:18-19 and especially for extended discussion that πνεῦμα in v. 16 is to be identified as God's Spirit as a part of eschatological restoration blessing and anticipates the concept of "fruit" in v. 19.

17. In this respect note the somewhat parallel language of 57:15b (ὀλιγοψύχοις διδοὺς μακροθυμίαν) and 57:18b (ἔδωκα αὐτῷ παράκλησιν), the latter of which appears to be a conceptual development of the former and which directly precedes the phrase "creating fruit" in Aquila and Symmachus and "creating the fruit of the lips" in those LXX MSS lining up with the MT.

18. It is certainly possible that all of these elements were not merely represented in early Septuagintal tradition but actually occurred in a "mixed text" no longer extant, on the possibility of which, see M. Silva, "Old Testament in Paul," in *Dictionary of Paul and His Letters* (ed. G. F. Hawthorne, R. P. Martin, and D. G. Reid; Downers Grove: InterVarsity, 1993), 633, who gives as an example Isa 10:22-23 in Rom 9:27-28, which combines unique readings from Codex A and Codex B. It is just as possible that here Paul is combining two LXX traditions. For the same phenomenon, see Justin Martyr with respect to Dan 7:9-14, where he combines the old LXX and Theodotion (on which consult H. B. Swete, *An Introduction to the Old Testament in Greek* [Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1902]1,421-22).

19. See my "Old Testament Background of Rev 3.14," *NTS* 42 (1996): 139-40, for discussion of the following: (1) that LXX Isaiah was translated before the first Christian century; (2) the various second-century A.D. dates of the translations of Aquila, Theodotion, and Symmachus, as well as the notion that they are all revisions of prior Greek translations that predate the NT (especially Theodotion probably revised on the basis of a proto-Theodotion dating from the first century B.C.); (3) these three revisions also show varying degrees of acquaintance with prior Jewish exegetical traditions. See further N. F. Marcos, *The Septuagint in Context* (Leiden: Brill, 2000), 21-152 (passim), especially for discussion of D. Barthelemy's groundbreaking theory about the dependence of the "Three" (though especially Aquila) upon prior Greek revisions, which is broadly accepted, though there is debate about aspects of it. Marcos likewise further discusses debates revolving around the use of prior Jewish exegetical tradition by Aquila, Theodotion, and Symmachus (on the preceding issues, see also K. H. Jobes and M. Silva, *Invitation to the Septuagint* [Grand Rapids: Baker, 2001], 37-42, 171-73). The upshot of all of this is that these versions of the LXX probably often witness pre-Christian Greek readings.

from which he drew some of the crucial terms to compose his famous "fruits of the Spirit" passage in Gal 5:22-23: "the *fruit of the Spirit* is love, joy, peace, patience ... (ὁ δὲ καρπὸς τοῦ πνεύματος ἐστὶν ἀγάπη χαρὰ εἰρήνη, μακροθυμία . . .). Isaiah 27²⁰ and 32 may also be in Paul's peripheral vision. Therefore, if the influence of Isaiah 32 has been felt on Paul in Gal 5:22, as some have briefly proposed, how much more that of Isa 57:16-19.

Indeed, the only two places in the entire scriptural tradition of the OT and NT where the combination of the above five words occurs is in Isa 57:15-19 and Gal 5:22. Enhancing this is the observation that "God sending forth the Spirit" is also close at hand in Galatians (Gal 4:6) and uniquely similar (even in comparison to Luke 1:35; 24:49; and Acts 1:8) in all of the NT to Isa 57:16's "the Spirit will go forth from me."²¹

Thus, the viability of this passage's influence on Paul consists in the fact (1) that we know he read and was quite familiar with both the MT and the LXX of Isaiah (especially Isaiah 40-66), (2) that he actually quotes from the LXX of Isa 57:19 in Eph 2:17²² and cites Isa 54:1 (LXX) in Gal 4:27, (3) that the combined wording of Gal 5:22 is uniquely common only to Paul and Isaiah 57, and (4) similarly the concept of "spiritual fruit" occurs in these two passages, as well as often in other Isaianic passages, where reference to God's Spirit also occurs, which confirms the Isaianic connection, as we will see below. And even if the Septuagintal reading "fruit" in Isa 57:18 postdates the first century, which is highly unlikely, it shows that the Hebrew of Isa 57:18 had the potential to be interpretively rendered into Greek in such a manner.

That this is not merely a formal parallel but a material one is also borne out by focusing further on the observation that the notion of the Spirit creating fruit that is nonphysical but spiritual in character is a unique idea to Isaiah in all of the OT and to Galatians 5 in the NT. When this common notion is then seen to be in an eschatological context in both Isaiah and Galatians,²³ the concept becomes even more unique. In particular, both passages are closely linked to contexts that

20. On which, see the appended excursus.

21. Though we will see below that Isa 48:16 is more centrally alluded to in Gal 4:6. See also ἔξαπποστελεῖς τὸ πνεῦμά σου in Ps 103:30, though this refers to God's creation of all life, including animals and fish.

22. The likelihood of Paul's reference to the standard LXX tradition in Eph 2:17 is pointed to by two observations: (1) Paul omits the introductory "creating the fruit of lips" in the MT and (2) refers to "the ones far" and "the ones near," in line with the plurals of the LXX, in contrast to the MT's singular "the far and near." Even if one were not to hold to Pauline authorship of Ephesians, it stands in early Pauline tradition.

23. Note in the broader context of Galatians reference to "delivering us out of this present evil age" (1:4), "the fullness of the time came" (4:4), and "new creation" (6:15).

have to do with new creation. In fact, the LXX phrase in Isa 57:15-16 explicitly expresses this new-creation theme: God will come down from his heavenly abode and be "the one giving life to the crushed of heart . . . for my Spirit will go forth from me, and I have created all breath." The Spirit is the agent by which God creates new life in Isaiah 57.²⁴

This idea of end-time new creation in Isa 57:15-16 is not anomalous within the book but is a natural part of a broader theme of new creation woven throughout Isaiah 40-66, the most explicit texts being Isa 43:18-19, 65:17, and 66:22. Isa 43:18-20 is but part of a series of pericopae in the so-called Book of Consolation (Isaiah 40-55) that explains the restoration of exiled Israel as a new creation or at least integrally associates the two concepts of restoration and creation (Isa 40:28-31; 41:17-20; 42:5-9; 44:21-23; 44:24-28; 45:1-8; 45:9-13; 45:18-20; 49:8-13; 51:1-3; 51:9-11; 51:12-16; 54:1-10 [cf. v. 5]; 55:6-13).²⁵ Isa 60:15-22, 65:17-25, and 66:19-24 continue the same thematic emphasis. It should

24. The last clause in the LXX of Isa 57:16 ("and I have created all breath") is possibly a reference to the old-creation reality of God creating all human life (as seen below in the excursus in the Testament of Moses) but is better viewed as related to the conditions of the new creation in which all human life would be created by God (accordingly, the use of the aorist tense could well be a "prophetic perfect" way of foretelling that God will create all life in the coming new creation, in line with the same repeated use of the aorists only two verses away in 57:18 [e.g., ἰσάμην αὐτὸν], which is immediately interpreted by a future tense in v. 19 [ἰάσομαι αὐτούς]). Or, alternatively, the LXX could be rendered, "the Spirit will come forth from me, even to all breath I have made," or "the Spirit will come forth from me, and [it will come forth to] all breath I have made" (though this translation might be more natural if "breath" were in the dative and not the accusative. Nevertheless, the accusative could be a so-called "terminal accusative" in which "after verbs of motion [e.g., verbs of 'coming'] the accusative may be used without a preposition to express the goal" or destination, on which see generally H. W. Smyth, *Greek Grammar* [Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1984], 358). Accordingly, "all breath" would represent the destination toward which the movement of God's Spirit is directed. Along these lines, the Targum of v. 16b interpretively paraphrases with "for I am about to restore the spirits of the dead and the breathing beings I have made" (interestingly here, as in our above proposal, the Targum sees the first verb of v. 16b doing double duty and being implied in the second clause). Perhaps, even the phrase "I have created all breath" (πνοὴν πᾶσαν ἐγὼ ἐποίησα) in v. 16b is further developed in v. 18h, "the one who creates fruit" (Symmachus and Aquila) or "the one who creates the fruit of the lips" (κτιζὼν καρποσ χειλῶν, so LXX following MT). This would identify even more closely the coming new creation (of vv. 15-16) with God's creation of fruit (v. 18) as a part of the new cosmos. Likewise, the LXX of v. 15h, as we saw above, also predicts a coming new creation: "giving life to the heart of the crushed," which is emphasized by the Hebrew text of v. 15b: God will descend from his heavenly temple "in order to make alive the spirit of the lowly and to make alive the spirit of the crushed."

25. See C. Stuhlmueller, *Creative Redemption in Deutero-Isaiah* (AnBib 43; Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1970), 66-98, 109-61, 193-208; W. J. Dumbrell, *The End of the Beginning* (Homebrush West, Australia: Lancer, 1985), 97-100.

not be surprising that the latter-day work of the Spirit is part of an introduction to two of these pericopae (Isa 42:1; 44:3), which, in fact, continues an earlier theme of new creation by the Spirit in Isa 26:18—19 and 32:15-18 (and possibly 30:23-28, on which see n. 11 above). God's act of new creation as restoration is also described outside of chap. 43 as his "redempticin" of Israel (e.g., 44:1-8; 44:24-45:7; 54:1-10)²⁶ and as a new Exodus (cf. 40:3-11; 41:17-20; 44:24-28; 51:1-13; 52:7—10; ee also 43:16-21).²⁷ Some of the specific links between the "Spirit" and "fruit" in Isaiah, which are part of the new-creation theme, likely reflect the same original link at the first creation, where the "Spirit" (πνεῦμα, Gen 1:2) was the agent of the creation, including trees bearing fruit" (καρπός, Gen 1:11,12,29).

Turning to the NT, we should note that the account of the coming of the Spirit in Acts 1-2 combines Isa 32:15 (alluded to in Acts 1:8) and Isa 7:19 (Acts 2:39, "the promise is for you and your children and for all who are far off"). Thus, the linkage seen above between chaps. 32 and 57 within Isaiah (LXX) itself was apparently recognized, at least partly, in the Lukan narration of the Spirit's coming at Pentecost. Likewise, Ephesians quotes Isa 57:19 in direct connection to an explanation of the work of the eschatological Spirit (2:17-22), which is a development there of "the Holy Spirit of promise" from 1:13, itself deriving most probably from the undoubted early Pentecost tradition about Christ "receiving the promise of the Holy Spirit," which he then poured out on believers (Acts 2:33). Strikingly, Gal 3:14 is even closer to Acts 2:33 than Eph 1:13: "in order that we might receive the promise of the Spirit" (ἵνα τὴν ἐπαγγελίαν τοῦ πνεύματος λάβωμεν; cf. Acts 2:33, τὴν τε ἐπαγγελίαν τοῦ πνεύματος τοῦ ἁγίου λαβῶν).

Thus, another link to the coming of the Spirit at Pentecost occurs in Galatians. This theme is picked up again in Gal 4:6 ("God has sent forth the Spirit" = γὰρ ἀπέστειλεν ὁ θεὸς τὸ πνεῦμα), which is the closest parallel in the NT to Isa 32:15 ("until the Spirit from on high should come upon you" = ἕως ἃν ἐπέλθῃ ἐφ' ὑμᾶς πνεῦμα ἐφ' ὑψηλοῦ) and, as we have seen, especially 57:16 (= "the Spirit will come forth from me" = πνεῦμα γὰρ παρ' ἐμοῦ ἐξελεύσεται).²⁸ Also striking in this regard in comparison to Gal 4:4, 6 (ἐξαπέστειλεν ὁ θεὸς τὸν υἱὸν... ἐξαπέστειλεν ὁ θεὸς τὸ πνεῦμα) is Isa 48:16, though overlooked by virtually all corn-

26. Stuhlmüller, *Creative Redemption*, 112-34, 196-208.

27. Ibid., 66-73, 82-94; Dumbrell, *End of the Beginning*, 15-18, 97.

28. In fact, Gal 4:6 is the only NT passage where the verb ἐξαπέστειλλω appears together with πνεῦμα. Actually Ps 103:10 (ἐξαποστελεῖς τὸ πνεῦμά σου) is closer verbally to Gal 4:6 than Isaiah 57, though the former concerns God's preservation of the old creation and only the latter deals with new creation; thus, Paul's reference in Gal 4:6 is more probably an allusion to the Pentecost event, perhaps with Isa 57:16b echoed, since we have already seen that it was uniquely similar in all of the OT to the Psalm text.

mentators (albeit see Scott's ambiguous reference below). Isa 48:16 refers to God's two primary agents, who will carry out Israel's future restoration, which is set in a second Exodus context (cf. 48:10-11, 20-21): "the Lord has sent me [the messianic servant] and his Spirit" (κύριος ἀπέσταλκέν με καὶ τὸ πνεῦμα αὐτοῦ) who both become the means of the Lord's "redemption" (compare ῥύομαι in 48:17 with Gal 4:5's ἐξαγοράζω). Nowhere else in the OT is there such a reference to God "sending" both his messianic agent and the Spirit to accomplish his redemption except Isa 48:16-17. This is most likely, therefore, an allusion also to Isa 48:16,3u with perhaps an echo of the "sending of the Spirit" language of Isaiah 32 and 57, which is plausible since Paul's mind weaves in and out of Isaiah, especially chaps. 40-60, throughout Galatians.³¹

The fulfillment motif of the Spirit's advent from 4:6 continues only a few verses later at 4:23-29: "the son [born] by the free woman through the promise"; "children of promise;" "[born] according to the Spirit." These three phrases lead up to and conclude a quotation from Isa 54:1 (Gal 4:27), the longest OT quotation in the book (it may even be that the notion of Christians as "sons" [υἱοὶ] in Gal 3:7, 26; 4:6, 7, 22, 30 derives from Isa 54:1 and 13, where Israel is called "children" and "sons," respectively).

In chap. 5, Paul identifies the Galatian believers with this promised Spirit: if they have truly received the Spirit (3:14; 4:6, 29), then they will act on the basis of the Spirit (5:5, 16-18). Perhaps not surprisingly, C. H. Cosgrove has suggested that 5:5 ("for we through the Spirit, by faith, are waiting for the hope of righteousness") alludes to

29. It is grammatically possible that this could be translated "the Lord and his Spirit sent me," since τὸ πνεῦμα could be accusative or nominative, though the phrase is most naturally taken as accusative because of word order with τὸ πνεῦμα following κύριος ἀπέσταλκέν με.

30. See also Isa 61:1, "the Spirit of the Lord God is upon me ... he has sent me to bind up the brokenhearted, to proclaim liberty to captives, and freedom to prisoners," recalling also that Gal 3:1-3 refers to the Galatians as formerly having been "held in bondage."

31. See J. M. Scott, *Adoption as Sons of God: An Exegetical Investigation into the Background of ΤΥΙΘΕΣΙΑ in the Pauline Corpus* (WONT 2/48; Tübingen: Mohr-Siebeck, 1992), 167-71, 179; after discussing previous proposals for the background of the dual "sending of the Son and the Spirit" here (esp. cf. Wis 9:10, 17), he proposes that the "sending of Moses" at the Exodus is the main background (supplemented by a 2 Sam 7:14 Jewish tradition), however, that background never includes the "sending of the Spirit," except in an indirect way, where the notion of "sonship" is combined with the coming of the Spirit (bib. 1:23; 1:24:3), but the language of "sending" does not occur in these texts. In the midst of this argument, in a footnote, he merely says "Cf. also the sending (ἀποστέλλειν) of the prophet and the Spirit in Isa 48:16 in the context of Exodus typology," which appears to imply that he sees the possibility of its being a supplemental influence.

Isa 32:15-17: "where eschatological righteousness appears, there the eschatological Spirit is to be found (Isa 32:15-17; Gal 5:5)." ³² In support of this suggestion, it is not coincidental that the combination of the "Spirit" (πνεῦμα) with "righteousness" (δικαιοσύνη) in an eschatological context occurs only in the book of Isaiah (Isa 11:4-5 [?]; 32:15-17; 42:1, 5-6; 61:1-333) and Jewish traditions alluding to Isaiah 11 (*Pss. Sol.* 17:37[42]; 18:8[7]; Testament of Judah 24, the first two alluding to Isa 11:2, 4 and the last to 11:1-2ff.), so that, even if Isaiah 32 were not specifically in mind, at the least, the broader background of Isaiah's expectation likely is.

Indeed, Paul's language of being "led by the Spirit" (Gal 5:18) is paralleled in the Greek OT (ἄγω + πνεῦμα), except in Isa 63:11-15.34 The Isaiah passage rehearses what God did at the Exodus as a background from which to plea that he would do the same thing again in a new, second Exodus from exile in Babylon:

Then he remembered the ancient days, saying, where is he that brought up from the sea the shepherd of the sheep? Where is he that put his Holy Spirit in them? *Who led* [ἄγαγών] Moses with his right hand, the arm of his glory? He forced the water to separate before him to make himself an everlasting name. He led [ἤγαγεν] them through the deep, as a horse through the wilderness, and they fainted not, and as cattle through a plain: the Spirit came down from the Lord, and guided them; in this manner you led [ἤγαγες] your people to make yourself a glorious name. Turn from heaven, and look from your holy habitation and from your glory: where is your zeal and your strength [to deliver us from exile]?

The prophet petitions that the Spirit that led both Moses and Israel out of the first exile in Egypt be sent again to lead Israel out of exile in Babylon.³⁵ It would not appear to be mere happenstance that Isa 57:16-18 is the only other OT passage that uses the similar language

32. *The Cross and the Spirit* (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1988), 61.

33. The connection with the Spirit in 61:1 is made even more directly in Ms 534 of the LXX, which has "planting of the Spirit filvciliaTod" instead of "planting of the Lord" in v. 3: "The Spirit of the Lord God is upon me.... So they will be called oaks of righteousness, the planting of the Spirit." The word *irvi;i4ia* in Isa 11:4 appears to be an anthropomorphism ("breath"), though the Spirit may be in the background because of vv. 1-2.

34. However, the prophet Ezekiel says of himself that "the Spirit took me up and led me" (Ezek 8:3; 11:1, 24), referring to the introduction of divine revelation to the prophet.

35. Accordingly, *Midr. Deut. Rab.* 9:9 portrays God saying to Moses, "in this world you have led My children, in the [messianic] time to come also, I will have you lead them," which then adduces Isa 63:11 in support. See also Neh 9:19-20, where also God's "Spirit" (n/61m) and God's "guiding" (66nyl;co) occur in association in describing Israel in the wilderness after the first Exodus.

of the "Spirit coming down from God" in connection with his "leading" Israel and actually applies it to the coming time of restoration (though the verb in v. 18 is not ἄγω but the synonym καθοδηγέω ["guide"] and is attested only in Aquila's version,³⁶ which attempts to represent more accurately the MT's "and I will lead him" [וַיְנַחֵם]).³⁷ Paul appears to draw from, at least, Isa 63:11-15 in affirming that Isaiah's petition for God's eschatological "leading of his people by the Spirit" has begun to be answered with the coming of the Spirit to believers in the new age³⁸ (Paul also alludes to Isa 63:10 ["they . . . grieved his Holy Spirit"] in Eph 4:30: "do not grieve the Holy Spirit of God"; see also Isa 63:11 in Heb 13:20). They are no longer in the old age, which is variously termed "this present evil age" (1:4) or the age "under law" (Gal 3:23; 4:4, 21) and "under the elements of the [old] world" (4:3). Rather, their reception of the Spirit has launched them into a new world, "a new creation" (6:15), where they "are led by the Spirit" and consequently are no longer bound to the age "under the law" (Gal 5:18) characterized by "circumcision," which is no longer in force (6:15).³⁹ The Galatians are those who have begun to participate

36. Ps 142:10 (LXX) is the next closest parallel (τὸ πνεῦμά σου τὸ ἀγαθὸν ὀδηγήσει με ἐν γῆ εὐθείᾳ) but does not use Ciyui and is not found in an eschatological restoration context like that of Isaiah 57 and 63, being applied only to David's life. Nevertheless, see W. N. Wilder, *Echoes of the Exodus Narrative in the Context and Background of Galatians 5:18* (Studies in Biblical Literature 23; New York: Peter Lang, 2001), passim, who has made a cogent case that, while the influence of Isa 63:11-14 upon Gal 5:18 "should not be overlooked" (p. 138), Ps 142:10 is the OT passage through which "the exodus background of Gal 5:18 is largely mediated" (p. 182). Both Isaiah 63 and Psalm 142 contribute important background for Gal 5:18.

37. After the reference to "guiding," Aquila continues with "I have given to him comfort and for the ones desiring [καὶ τοῖς ποθεινοῖς] him (I am) creating fruit [καρπός] (the latter of which is an alternative reading in Aquila, and Symmachus). The mention of "the ones desiring him" may be continued only four verses later with reference to those "who desire [ἐπιθυμοῦσιν] to know my [God's] ways," and who "desire [ἐπιθυμοῦσιν] to draw near to God" (58:2) in contrast to those who selfishly "find your [own] desires [θελήματα] (58:3). This would appear to have further affinity with Gal 5:16-17, where ἐπιθυμέω and its noun form refer to "desires" of the "flesh" in contrast to "desires" of the "Spirit." Indeed, such a connection between the coming of God's Spirit in Isa 57:16 and Gal 5:19 was made as early as Tertullian (on which, see below, p. 34).

38. Other passages use prefixed forms of ἄγω to predict that God will again "lead" his people as he did at the Exodus (Ier 38:8-9; Ezek 20:10, 14, 22, 34; likewise Ezek 34:13).

39. Almost identically, Rom 8:14 says, "all who are being led by the Spirit of God, these are sons of God," where also the Spirit is inextricably linked to "life" (Rom 8:11, 13 and Gal 5:25), to enmity with the "flesh" (Rom 8:4-13 and Gal 5:16-19), and to being a mark of sonship (Rom 8:14-23 and Gal 4:5-7). The mention of "firstfruits [ἀπαρχή] of the Spirit" in Rom 8:23 may bring the Romans passage even closer to Gal 5:18-22 (note that in the LXX ἀπαρχή is used in parallelism or synonymously with καρπός: Deut 26:2; Neh 10:38; Pss. Sol. 15:3. About Rom 8:18-27, N. T. Wright, *Christian Origins and the Question of God*, vol. 1: *The New Testament and the People of God* (London: SPCK / Minneapolis:

the fulfillment of Isaiah's prophecies of new Exodus and new creation which is probably one reason Paul calls them "the Israel of God" in 6:16.⁴⁰

In this respect, Paul's statement only two verses earlier than Gal 5:18 that the readers were to "walk by the Spirit" may even be an echo of the Hebrew text of Isa 63:13 ("God led them"), which uses a form of the Hebrew word "walk" (Hiphil of *lrt*), as does also Isa 48:17 ("the Lord ... who leads you in the way you will walk," Qal of *tPri*), both of which, we have already seen, describe the "walking" as an effect of the "Spirit" (see Isa 48:16). These are the only places in the OT where this combination occurs in a prophetic context about the restoration of Israel, except Ezek 36:27, which we shall discuss below.⁴¹

These observations are supported by other studies, which have contended that Paul's "story" of the Galatians follows "the same narrative flow of the Exodus," though transformed into a new Exodus.⁴² More particularly, Todd A. Wilson has attempted to plot their narrative location throughout the epistle as being in the "wilderness," where the Galatians are in danger of rebellion and apostasy.⁴³ Gal 5:13-26 is among the segments he points out in this connection, where he sees communal infighting (5:15, 19-21, 26) and exclusion from entering the kingdom of God (5:21b = the promised land).⁴⁴ Worth considering, he says, is whether Paul's juxtaposition with "the fruit of the Spirit" (5:22-23) also reflects the Exodus wilderness background and the promised inheritance, especially as redeveloped by the new Exodus prophecies of Isaiah, as well as the restoration depictions in Hosea and Joel.⁴⁵

These connections to Isaiah (esp. 32, 48, 54, 57, and 63) and the Pentecost tradition outside and especially within Galatians compose a plausible context rendering it reasonable that Gal 5:22 would allude

Fortress, 1992), 406-7, says, with remarkable agreement with our approach to Gal 5:18, "the Exodus of Israel was a model for the death and resurrection of Jesus, and both of these events point forward to a greater exodus to come, when the whole cosmos will be liberated from its Egypt, its present state of futility" (on which, see further S. C. Keesmaat, "Exodus and the Intertextual Transformation of Tradition in Romans 8.14—30," *JSNT* 54 [1994]: 29-56). Strikingly, Heb 13:20 applies Isa 63:11 (LXX) as a description of Christ's resurrection.

40. On which see my "Peace and Mercy upon the Israel of God: The Old Testament Background of Galatians 6,16b," *Bib* 80 (1999), 204-23.

41. The next closest contexts where the same combination occurs are Neh 9:19-20 (an Exodus context), Ezek 3:14 (the Spirit empowering Ezekiel in his prophetic ministry), and Ps 143:10 (the Spirit leading King David).

42. Keesmaat, *Paul and His Story*, 170.

43. Wilson, "Wilderness Apostasy and Paul's Portrayal of the Crisis in Galatians," *NTS* 50 (2004): 550-71.

44. *Ibid.*, 16-21.

45. *Ibid.*, 21.

to the Isaianic promise of the Spirit, especially since the preceding Isaiah 54 quotation is repeatedly linked to the Spirit. Our proposal that Gal 5:22 alludes specifically to Isa 57:15-19, and perhaps echoes Isaiah 32, should not be surprising, since both Isa 32:15 and 57:19 are alluded to elsewhere (in Acts 1:8 and 2:39, respectively), the latter, as observed above, quoted in full in Eph 2:17, also in conjunction with the promised Spirit. All of the above connections between Isaiah 57 and Galatians are perhaps the best explanation of why Irenaeus and Tertullian combined Isa 57:16 with Gal 4:4-6 and 5:18-19 (on which, see the excursus).

Additional Old Testament Background to Galatians 5:22

In addition to Isaiah 32 and, especially, 57, other texts in the Hebrew of Isaiah make the same connection between the latter-day advent of the Spirit and the fruits of godly characteristics and may have been included in Paul's peripheral Isaianic vision in Gal 5:22. Isa 11:1-5 prophesies that a "branch from his [Jesse's] roots *will bear fruit* [יִפְרֶה]. And the Spirit of the Lord will rest on Him, the spirit of wisdom ... [seven fruits of the Spirit are mentioned in the following phrases, including 'righteousness' and 'faithfulness'.⁴⁶ This is the closest contextual link between "fruit" and the "Spirit" in the OT, though "fruit" does not occur in the Greek version, and even in the Hebrew the word is the verbal form ("to bear fruit"). Furthermore, it refers to the coming eschatological leader of Israel and not to the people in general, though what was true of Israel's king was often applicable to the people by virtue of corporate representation (and we will see below that early Judaism explicitly understood Isa 11:1-2 in this dual manner).

There is also the similar link between the Spirit and its production of fertility or fruits in the following Isaiah passages: Isa 44:3-4: "I will pour out my Spirit on your seed ... and they will spring up like grass among the waters like poplars by streams of water"; 61:1, 3: "The Spirit of the Lord God is upon me. ... So they will be called oaks of righteousness, the planting of the Lord,"⁴⁷ though as in 11:1-2 the Spirit is applied to Israel's end-time leader (see also 61:11, and probably also Isa 4:2-4 for further relevant passages).

Elsewhere in Isaiah the coming new creation is said to be characterized by abundant fruit in Israel, which is often explicitly interpreted to be various godly attributes among redeemed Israelites, though the Spirit is not mentioned in these passages (with the possible

46. The eschatological fruitfulness depicted in Joel 2:21-27 is also inextricably linked to the pouring out of the Spirit in 2:28-32 [=3:1-5, MT]: the latter is probably an interpretation of the former, though limitations of space prohibit further analysis.

47. As observed above, MS 534 of the 1.XX has "planting of the *Spirit*" [πνεύματος] instead of "planting of the Lord," drawing out explicitly the link with the Spirit in v. 1.

exception of Isa 27:5-8, which does include reference to God's πνεύμα⁴⁸): Isa 27:5b-6 ("Let him make peace with me, Let him make peace with me. In the days to come Jacob will take root, Israel will blossom and sprout; and they will fill the whole world with fruit"); 37:30-32 ("sow, reap, plant vineyards, and eat their fruit. And the surviving remnant of the house of Judah shall again take root downward and bear fruit [וְעֵשָׂה פְרִי] upward. For out of Jerusalem shall go forth a remnant, and out of Mount Zion survivors. The zeal of the Lord of hosts shall perform this"); 45:8 ("Drip down, O heavens, from above, and let the clouds pour down righteousness; let the earth open up and salvation bear fruit, and righteousness spring up with it. I, the Lord, have created it"); 51:3 ("Indeed, the Lord will comfort Zion; he will comfort all her waste places. And her wilderness he will make like Eden, and her desert like the garden of the Lord; joy and gladness will be found in her, thanksgiving and sound of a melody"); 60:21 ("Then all your people will be righteous; they will possess the land forever, the branch of my planting, the work of My hands, that I may be glorified"; on which, see in. Sanh. 10:1 in allusion to the same text).⁴⁹

This additional OT material from Isaiah provides evidence enhancing the proposal that Paul's "fruit of the Spirit" formulation was derived from Isaiah. If this material was included in the apostle's purview, then he may have made a collective allusion to Isaiah 57 and 32 together with Isa 11:1-5 and 44:2-4, because both the "Spirit" and "fruit" (or the equivalent terms) also occur in these passages.⁵⁰ On the other hand, if these other passages were not in mind, then they may have provided unmentioned or unconscious stimulus for Paul to be attracted to Isaiah 57 and 32.

The Jewish Background

Qumran alludes to some of the above Isaianic texts and applies them to the DSS community conceived of as eschatological Israel, bearing

48. See further the discussion of the LXX of Isaiah 27 in the excursus, where God's πνεῦμα is mentioned in the midst of that passage (27:8).

49. Like Isaiah, Hos 14:5-8 portrays Israel's end-time spiritual vitality in terms of agricultural fruitfulness. For similar imagery, see also Isa 55:10-13 in comparison with 56:3; likewise note 58:11; 65:8, 17-22; Jer 1:9-12.

50. Of course other OT passages outside Isaiah refer to Israel metaphorically as a tree or vine bearing fruit (or not doing so), but none mentions the Spirit (e.g., Ps 80:8-18; Jer. 2:21; 8:13; 11:16; 12:10; 24:8-10; Ezek 15:1-8; 17:1-10; 19:10-14; Hos 10:1; Mic 7:1—4; the majority of which do not even contain K up 76 g in the LXX); likewise end-time prophecies of Israel's fruitfulness occur elsewhere outside Isaiah, but, again, not in connection with the Spirit (Jer 31:27-28; 32:41; Ezek 17:22-24; Hos 14:5-8; Joel 2:18-25 [though literal fruit is in mind]; Amos 9:13-15). It is possible but very difficult to demonstrate that these references, in addition to the Isaiah ones, could be faintly in mind (as suggested by Barclay, *Obeying the Truth*, 121).

the fruits of God's Spirit (1QS 4:3-11; 8:1-5; 1QH 8:1-13; cf. also 1QH 6:15-19).⁵¹ Particularly striking is 1QS 4:3-11, which sets out a contrast between the "Spirit of light's" works in the "sons of light" and the "spirit of darkness's" works in the "sons of perversity" (on which, see cols. 3-4). Among many good works (18 or more), the following overlap with Gal 5:22: "goodness," "faith," and "peace ... fruitfulness ... and eternal joy." Those who do these works are described as "all who walk by [or "in" (preposition n)] this [Spirit];' a parallel to Gal 5:25 ("If we live by the Spirit, let us also walk by the Spirit"). Among a number of evil works, the following are mentioned by 1QS, which are comparable with the "deeds of the flesh" in Gal 5:19-21: "idols of defilement," "cupidity," "abominable deeds committed in the spirit of lust." Apparently unnoticed heretofore, this Qumran text is a partial allusion to Isa 11:1-5 (see the chart of textual comparisons on the following page—p. 18).

Similar to Gal 5:22-23 and to 1QS4, though without mention of the "Spirit," in 1QS 8:1-5 "the Council of the Community" is said "to practise truth, righteousness, justice, loving charity, and modesty . . . to guard the faith ... with a ... contrite spirit," and, in this respect, "shall be established in truth as an everlasting planting." This passage also alludes to another Isaiah prophecy of Israel's figurative fecundity (the last phrase, "everlasting planting," is an allusion to Isa 60:21: "They will possess the land forever, the branch of his planting";⁵² cf. also Isa 61:3). Along the same lines, 1QH 6:15-19 (= 14:15-19) also utilizes the identical Isaiah 11 and 60 allusions as above: "And Thou hast sent out a sprouting as a flower that shall bloom forever, that the Shoot [allusion to Isa 11:1⁵³] may grow into the branches of the eternal planting [allusion to Isa 61:3⁵⁴].... And all the rivers of Eden [shall water] its [bou]ghs.... In its brilliant flames all the son[s of darkness] shall be consumed." Likewise, 1QH 8:5-13 (= 16:5-13) contains the same two Isaiah allusions in depicting virtually the same botanical imagery of eschatological Israel as God's "Shoot," "everlasting planting," and "fruitful planting ... for the glorious Eden and shall bear fr[uit for ever]." The last two Hymn Scroll texts have also included the new feature of the Qumran community being a verdant end-time "Eden."

Testament of Judah 24 is quite striking in relation to both Isaiah 11 and Gal 5:22 in its use of "Spirit" together with botanical images and a listing of spiritual characteristics:

51. The English references to 1QS and 1QH are to the edition of A. Dupont-Sommer, *The Essene Writings from Qumran* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1961).

52. Dupont-Sommer, *ibid.*, 91, has observed the allusion to Isaiah lying behind the phrase in 1QS 8.

53. So, e.g., *ibid.*, 219.

54. So, e.g., *ibid.*, 367; cf. likewise Isa 60:21.

Isaiah 11:2	1QS 4:3-4
<p>רוּחַ חֵכְמָה וּבִינָה...וּגְבוּרָה רוּחַ דַּעַת ("a <u>spirit of wisdom and understand-</u> <u>ing...and might, a spirit of knowl-</u> <u>edge.</u>" Cf. also 11:4 "he will judge rightly <u>for the meek</u> []" and 11:5: "<u>and faithfulness</u> [] the belt About his waist." Also, the Spirit will Cause him to "<u>judge in righteousness</u>" (וְשָׁפֵט בְּצֶדֶק), v. 4; likewise he will not "judge" (יִשְׁפֹּט) in a worldly manner (v. 3) and he will adjudicate in "<u>right-</u> <u>eousness</u>" (צֶדֶק , 5a).</p>	<p>רוּחַ עֲנָנָה...וּבִינָה וְחֻכְמַת גְּבוּרָה מְאֻמָּנָה... וְרוּחַ דַּעַת ("a <u>spirit of meekness ... and under-</u> <u>standing and wisdom, might with</u> <u>faithfulness, and wisdom, might with</u> <u>faithfulness...and a spirit of knowl-</u> <u>ledge</u>"). Also, the Spirit's work is "to level Before him the ways of true <u>righteous-</u> <u>ness</u> [צֶדֶק], and to set fear in his heart of the <u>judgments</u> [בְּמִשְׁפָּטֵי] of God" (4:2b-3a).</p>
Isaiah 11:1b-2a	1QS 4:6-7b
<p>"And a <u>branch from his roots will bear</u> <u>fruit</u> [וְנִצָּר מִשְׁרָשָׁיו יִפְרֶה]. And the Spirit of the Lord will rest on him."</p>	<p>"These are the counsels of the Spirit. ...And as for the visitations of all who walk by [or "in"] this (Spirit), it con- Sists of <u>healing... and fruits from the</u> <u>seed</u> (וּפְרִי־זֶרַע)"a Note that Eph 1:17 (δὲν ὑμῖν πνεῦμα σοφίας καὶ ἀποκαλύψεως ἐν ἐπιγνώσει αὐτοῦ) also applies the messianic fruits To the people of God.</p>

a. There is ambiguity about whether רוּחַ in cols. 3 and 4 refers to the divine "Spirit" or to the renewed human "spirit." Some translations prefer only the latter rendering for all occurrences there, while others see that the divine "Spirit" is in mind as the force influencing the renewed human "spirit," which is the case in Isa 11:1-5. The latter view of cols. 3-4 is probable in the light of expressions (among others) such as רוּחַ קְדוּשָׁה in 3:7 and 4:21, which is best rendered "Holy Spirit" or "Spirit of holiness" rather than "spirit of holiness" (following, e.g., Dupont-Sommer, *ibid.*, 77, 81; and J. H. Charlesworth et al. [ed.], *Dead Sea Scrolls: Rule of the Community* [Philadelphia: American Interfaith Institute, 1996], 13, 21, though other translations such as Martinez prefer the lower-case human reference throughout).

Upon the Messiah "the heavens will be opened ... to pour out the Spirit ... and he will pour the Spirit of grace on you [Israel].... This is the shoot of God ... and from your root will arise the Shoot, and through it will arise the rod of righteousness."

The passage clearly alludes to Isa 11:1-2ff. and applies what will be true of Israel's coming king to Israel itself. In addition, the king is to be characterized with "righteousness," "peace," and "gentleness," which are directly linked to the Spirit's coming on him, the latter two traits also found in Gal 5:22-23. Finally, this Spirit-led king will be "the fountain of life of all humanity," who "will be resurrected to life" (though the latter phrase is applied only to the patriarchs in

25:1). The link between the Spirit and resurrection life is also made in Gal 5:25, which we will argue below is conceptually a development of "the fruit of the Spirit" notion in Gal 5:22.

Though again without reference to the "Spirit," as in some of the Qumran texts, *Pss. Sol.* 14:1-5 (first cent. B.C.) likewise combines allusions from Eden and Isaiah 60 and 65: "The Lord's paradise, the trees of life, are his devout ones. Their planting is firmly rooted forever; they shall not be uprooted as long as the heavens shall last, for Israel is the portion and inheritance of God" (Isa 60:21; 65:22b [LXX]: "for as the days of the tree of life shall be the days of my people"; see also 61:3). The new-creation text of LXX Isa 65:22 itself (see 65:17-21) alludes to "the tree of life" from Genesis 2-3 (so virtually identical is *Tg. Isa.* 65:22).⁵⁵

All of these texts from Qumran and early Judaism attest a penchant to describe eschatological Israel as spiritually fruitful,⁵⁶ often in connection to the dynamic work of God's Spirit that has reinstated the primordial conditions of fertility, occasionally even referring explicitly to Eden.⁵⁷ Sometimes botanical images from Isaiah are actually

55. In connection to this, *Tg. Neof.* Gen 3:23b-24 asserts: "If he [Adam] had observed the precept of the Law and fulfilled 'its commandment he would live and endure forever like the tree of life.... For the Law is a tree of life for everyone who toils in it and keeps the commandments: he lives and endures like the tree of life in the world to come. The Law is good for all who labor in it in this world like the fruit of the tree of life." Also in mind in the LXX and Targum may be Prov 11:30: "the fruit of the righteous is a tree of life," itself an allusion to Genesis 2-3.

56. Likewise see early Judaism for the metaphorical use with respect to Israel, its leaders or their good works (JO. 16:26; 1 En. 93:5-8, 4 Ezra 5:23-24; 9:31-32; 2 Bar. 32:1; following Barclay, *Obedying the Truth*, 121).

57. See later Judaism: *Midr. Num. Rob.* 13:12: two of the six things taken from Adam because of his sin "which are to be restored through ... the Messiah" are "the fruit of the earth" and "the fruit of the tree" (the others are his lustre, his immortal life, his stature, and the luminaries). So identically *Midr. Gen. Rob.* 12:6. The Christian *Odes Sol.* 11:1-2 (ca. A.D. 100) has Christ saying, "My heart was pruned and its flower appeared ... and it produced fruits for the Lord. For the Most High circumcised me by his Holy Spirit" (likewise 11:12). Christ then speaks of God's people who also are fruitful: "And he took me to his Paradise ... (I contemplated blooming and fruit-bearing trees.... Their branches were flourishing and their fruits were shining; their roots (were) from an immortal land .) blessed, O Lord, are they who are planted in your land, and who have a place in your Paradise; and who grow in the growth of your trees" (11:16-19). In *Odes Sol.* 14:7-8 and 16:2-5, the "Spirit" also is closely associated with spiritual "fruits," so that the former may be the implied source of the latter. Irenaeus, *Against Heresies* 5.10.1, links Gal 5:6-22 (see *Against Heresies* 5.11.1) with the renewed condition of Eden: "men, if they ... receive the Spirit of God, and bring forth the fruit [καρποφοροῦσιν] thereof, shall be spiritual [πνεύματικοί], as being planted in the Paradise of God." Likewise Origen (*De Oratione* 25.3, 9-10) says twice: "let us bear the fruits of the Spirit in order that the Lord should walk about among us in a spiritual paradise." See also The Fathers according to Rabbi Nathan 40.1 (Minor Tractates of the Talmud): "Four things a man does, and he enjoys their fruits in this world while the stock is laid up for

employed in the depictions. Several of these passages refer to various virtues that are directly connected to or are expressions of the "fruit" image, while the other texts imply this. Thus, though they do not appear to be interdependent, both Paul in Gal 5:22 and some of these Jewish texts are on parallel tracks in describing, through the language of Isaiah, their respective communities as bearing "fruit" produced by God's "Spirit." That contemporary Jewish exegesis could do this makes more plausible the notion that Paul was capable of doing it.

THE SPIRIT IN GALATIANS 5:22-25 AS THE ESCHATOLOGICAL. LIFE-GIVER IN THE NEW CREATION

There are yet further hints of a fecund new creation in Gal 5:22-25, especially when seen against an Isaianic background. Gal 5:22, 25 says, after mention of "the fruit of the Spirit," that "fruitful" people who "live by the Spirit" will "walk by the Spirit." The "living" in v. 25 is best understood as "resurrection living." This appears to reflect an end-time role of the Spirit in raising the dead, which is also reflected elsewhere in Galatians, as well as generally elsewhere in Paul and in the OT. Not surprisingly, in addition to the well-known Ezek 37:3—14,⁵⁸ the only other place in the OT where resurrection life (with the terminology of ζάω/ζωή) is linked to the eschatological work of the Spirit (πνεῦμα) is Isaiah 57. Specifically, 57:15b of the LXX renders the vIT ("to make alive the heart of the crushed") fairly straightforwardly: "giving life to the crushed [broken] of heart" (δίδουζ ζωήν τοῖζ συντετριμμένοιζ τήν καρδίαν; the notion of resurrection is emphasized in the MT [and significant LXX MSS witness in line with the MT⁵⁹], since even the preceding clause has "to make alive the spirit

him in the world to come [among which are] ...acts of lovingkindness, establishing peace." Approximately 35x καρπός in the four Gospels refers to godly characteristics among Jesus' followers. Never, however, is it directly related to the Spirit. Once καρπός serves as an analogy for Christ's resurrection (John 12:24). Five times outside Gal 5:2 Paul uses καρπός to refer to godly characteristics among true Christians but never in connection to the Spirit.

58. It is not impossible that the preceding segment of Ezek 36:25-30 could also be echoed, since the passage prophesies, "I will give you a new heart and ... put my Spirit in you, and you will walk [πορεύομαι = ַלַּךְ] in my ordinances," in contrast to walking after "idols" (εἰδωλον) and in "uncleanness" [ἀκαθαρσία] characterized by Israel's former "fleshly" (σάρξ) existence; God will also "multiply fruit [καρπός]," though literal, not spiritual, fruit is in mind. These ideas and words are quite similar to those in Gal 5:16-25.

59. So mss V-Qmg-01 I'-86"-233 544 Tht., all of which read ζωωσαι ("to make alive") in an additional clause of the verse.

of the fallen").⁶⁰ The promise of resurrection is explained further in 57:16a through the affirmation that God "will not take vengeance on you forever," and he will not "be always angry with you." This prophecy is grounded (pip) in the assurance that "my Spirit will go forth from me, and I have created all breath,"⁶¹ Hence, the ground for God's future resurrection (v. 15b) and removal of anger (v. 16a) is the coming of the Spirit, who will create all beings in the new creation, another apparent reference to resurrection. Accordingly, the Targum of v. 16b interpretatively paraphrases "for I am about to restore the spirits of the dead and the breathing beings I have made." Both the LXX and the MT of 57:18 refer to this work of end-time resurrection as divine "healing."

Therefore, Gal 5:22-25 is not only like Isa 57:15-19 in combining the "Spirit" and "fruit" together with mention of "joy," "peace," and "patience" but even directly links the Spirit's work with the giving of resurrection life, in further resemblance to the Isaiah passage.⁶²

More generally, God's creation of abundant ethical fruit is part of the conception of Israel's new life in the new age. *Tg. Isa.* 45:8, for example, renders the Hebrew text's "Let the earth open up and *salvation bear fruit and righteousness spring up with it*" as "let the earth open *that the dead may live, and let virtue be revealed also.*"

Early and late Judaism followed and developed the OT's notion of the Spirit as the agent of the latter-day resurrection (e.g., *1 En.* 61:7; *b. `Abod. Zar.* 20b [e.g., "the holy spirit leads to eternal life"]; *Midr. Song Rab.* 1:1, 9; *Midr. Tanhuma*, Gen, Parashah L1. Noah 2.12 at Gen 8:1ff., part VI; cf. *1 En.* 49:3, which develops Isa 11:2). Reflection on the latter-day resurrection was sometimes developed in connection with the Garden of Eden according to the principle that "the last things must be like the first things" (e.g., see Ezek 36:26-35 above, as well as the *Gos. Barn.* 6:13: "behold, I make the last things as the first things").⁶³

60. The references to שְׁפָלִים and נִדְכָּאִים in isa 57:15b likely are not references to the "lowly" and "contrite" but are to be taken at face value as referring to the "fallen" and "crushed," both references to those who have been destroyed on earth and who will be resurrected.

61. That is, as noted above, with a prophetic perfect sense, "I *will* create all breath" or with the sense of the first verb being implied at the beginning of the second clause: "the Spirit will come forth from me, and [it will come forth to] all breath I have made."

62. Though, as noted above, Ezekiel 37 may also be echoed (e.g., Fick 37:14, "I will put my Spirit within you, and you will live").

63. Similarly, see Philo, *Plant.* 44: "For the man stamped with the Spirit [πνεύματι] which is after the image of God differs not a whit . . . *from the tree* [in context called 'the tree of Life ... in the midst of the Garden'] *that bears the fruit of immortal life* [τοῦ τὴν ἀθάνατον ζωὴν καρποφοροῦντος]: for both are imperishable." Though this is part of a

That we have been on the right track in identifying Gal 5:25 with the inaugurated eschatological resurrection life of a believer is pointed to from the following three observations: (1) We have already noted that mention of "living by the Spirit" (5:25), coming on the heels of allusion to the end-time new-creational "fruit of the Spirit" (5:22-23), is probably linked to Isaiah's promise of new creation (in anticipation of "new creation" in 6:15, on which see further discussion below). (2) In 5:24 those who are identified with Jesus (literally, "who are of Christ Jesus") "have crucified the flesh with its sinful desires," which likely refers to their identification with Christ's own crucifixion and its present effects for them; it is natural that, after referring to the believer's identification with Christ's crucifixion, Paul would speak of the believer's identification with Christ's resurrection. (3) In fact, 2:19-20 sets a precedent for a crucifixion-resurrection pattern in which the believer's life is identified with Christ's resurrection life: "For I died to the Law in order that I should live to God. I have been crucified with Christ, and no longer am I living, but Christ *lives* in me; and now the life which I am now living in the flesh, I *live* by faith in the Son of God who loved me and gave himself over on behalf of me."⁶⁴

The crucifixion-resurrection pattern of Gal 5:24-25 may even echo the "death-to-life" pattern of Isa 57:15-16 ("to make alive the spirit of the crushed and to make alive the spirit of the fallen" which

larger allegory on virtue and lacks the explicit redemptive-historical significance given it by other early Jewish and Christian writers, it is relevant for comparison since it is an interpretation of "the tree of life" in Eden with a number of similarities to Gal 5:22-25 and other Jewish writings, betraying a common tradition of speaking of Eden in terms of "the Spirit producing fruit, and immortal life" (compare with the similar use of language in Philo, *Worse Attacks the Better* 111). Somewhat analogously, the *Apoc. Adam* 6:1-5 (first to fourth cent. A.D.) portrays the righteous as "a remnant of the seed" who are "fruit-bearing trees" that "will not perish ... for they have not received [a] spirit from this [earthly] kingdom alone, but from an eternal angel they have received" the Spirit, presumably because "of the man upon whom the Holy Spirit has come" (*Apoc. Adam* 6:9, which is an allusion to the Servant imagery of Isa 42:1 [so G. Macrae, "Apocalypse of Adam," in *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha* (ed. J. H. Charlesworth; New York: Doubleday, 1983), 715]). This text does not refer to Eden but is also closely aligned with Gal 5:22, 25, in addition to the observation that both make use of Isaianic background.

64. In Gal 5:5 Paul says, "For we through the Spirit, by faith, are awaiting the hope of righteousness." This is likely another reference where the Spirit is the agent for the new life of Christ, though here the manner of the new life is categorized as "awaiting" the final revelation of divine righteousness. Gal 6:8 appears to be the only text in the epistle referring to an exclusively future reference to the Spirit: the one who identifies with the fleshly mode of existence now will experience corruption at the end, and the one who identifies with the Spirit's mode of existence in the present will inherit "eternal life" at the last day.

we saw above is rendered by the LXX by διδοὺς ζωὴν τοῖς συντετριμμένοις τὴν καρδίαν). The only other uses of "live" (ζάω) in the epistle are not inconsistent with this idea of resurrection life, and the only use of "life" (ζωή) in the letter explicitly supports this idea: "For the one who sows to his own flesh shall from the flesh reap corruption, but the one who sows to the Spirit shall from the Spirit reap eternal life." Again, we have the Spirit as the source or means to resurrection life spoken of in terms of agricultural fertility (6:8), though referring to the future, consummate phase of such life.

THE RELATION OF GALATIANS 5:22-25 TO THE CONCLUSION OF THE EPISTLE

The discussion so far has argued that Gal 5:22-25 is a highly charged eschatological passage about Isaiah's promised new creation, which is brought about through the agency of the Spirit. This understanding appears to reveal a link to Gal 6:14-16.

The conclusion of Gal 6:11-17 sums up one of the major themes of the epistle: Christ, and not the Law, is the identity marker of the new people of God.⁶⁵ After underscoring his authorship of the epistle (v. 11), Paul says that his opponents make circumcision compulsory in order that they would not "be persecuted for the cross of Christ" (v. 12). The reason (yap) that they do not want to be persecuted for the cross is because they would rather boast in and be identified with the Law (e.g., circumcision in the flesh) rather than boast in and be identified with Christ (v. 13). Paul, on the other hand, says in v. 14 that he prefers boasting in the cross with which he has identified by faith; consequently, he no longer has a place in the old "world," since that place has been destroyed (i.e., the world has been "crucified to him" and he has been "crucified to the world").

65. That 6:11-17 sums up the major themes of the epistle has been argued most trenchantly by J. A. D. Weima, "Gal 6,11-18: A Hermeneutical Key to the Galatian Letter," *Calvin Theological Journal* 28 (1993): 90-107; and likewise, idem, "The Pauline Letter Closings: Analysis and Hermeneutical Significance," *BBR* 5 (1995): 177-98. Weima underscores four major themes throughout Galatians which he sees summarized in 6:11-17, but all revolve around the central notion of identification with Christ: (1) boasting in the flesh vs. boasting in Christ; (2) avoiding persecution because of identity with Christ vs. willingness to be persecuted for identifying with Christ; (3) identifying with circumcision or uncircumcision vs. identification with Christ; (4) the old world vs. the new creation, the former whose focus is on the Law and the flesh, and the latter whose focus is on Christ. H. D. Betz, *Galatians* (Hermeneia; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1979), 321, says, "The whole argument in the letter leads up to the rule in v 15." See also E. J. Mearns, "The Culmination of Paul's Argument to the Galatians: Gal 5,1-6,17," *JSNT* 32 (1988): 79-91, who argues that the last two chapters of Galatians summarize the earlier themes of the epistle and are the culmination of Paul's overall argument.

Verses 15-16 explain why Paul boasts only in the cross: because neither circumcision nor uncircumcision matters one whit to God, since they are part of the old world that is passing away. What does matter, however, is the "new creation" since its inauguration is the new redemptive-historical stage that has made obsolete the earlier stage characterized by Torah. In the old age Torah was the epitome of divine revelation, but now its high position has been surpassed in the "new creation," where the zenith of God's revelation is Christ, a revelation only pointed to in the former age of Torah (e.g., cf. Gal 3:23-25). The "new creation" is the other side of the coin of the crucifixion; Jesus' crucifixion was inextricably linked to his resurrection by the Spirit since the former was necessary for, and led to, the latter, which Paul understands elsewhere to be a new creation.⁶⁶

Therefore, "new creation" in 6:15 is a way of speaking of the resurrection life through the Spirit mentioned in 5:25, both of which should be seen as beginning with Christ's own resurrection itself. The significant link between 5:25 and 6:16 also consists in the common use of στοιχέω, where in each case the default word for "walk" (περιπατέω) could easily have been used (e.g., see Gal 5:16), but the rarer word στυχέω ("keep in step with" or "line up with," etc.) is employed.⁶⁷ M. V. Hubbard has rightly argued with regard to 5:25, as well as the earlier references to the Spirit and the concept of life,

since the Galatians have received the Spirit (3:3, 14; 4:6), have been "made alive" by the Spirit (3:21-22 with 3:14 and 5:25), have been "begotten" by the Spirit (4:29), "live" by the Spirit (5:25), "walk" by the Spirit (5:16, 1.8, 25), and have become "children" and "heirs" through the Spirit in their hearts (4:6-7), Paul argues that the law and circumcision are no longer relevant. This entire chain of reasoning is perfectly summarized under the heading "the motif of transformation," and succinctly recapitulated in the phrase, "neither circumcision nor uncircumcision, but *new creation!*"⁶⁸

In this respect, 5:25 and 6:15 also develop the introduction to the epistle (1:1, "God ... who raised him [Jesus] from the dead") and the crucifixion-resurrection pattern seen above in 2:19-20 (cf. 5:24-25). The same twofold crucifixion-resurrection pattern is discernible in

66. See my "Old Testament Background of Reconciliation in 2 Corinthians 5-7 and Its Bearing on the Literary Problem of 2 Cor 6,14-7,1."

67. Unfortunately, the limits of the present essay do not allow consideration of the transitional passage of Gal 6:1-10 nor why Paul uses *atoixi=0*.

68. *New Creation in Paul's Letters and Thought* (SNTSMS 119; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 229 (see also p. 235), though why Hubbard did not include the reference to the "Spirit" and "life" in Gal 6:8 is not clear. We also disagree with Hubbard's attempt to limit "transformation" to the anthropological and not also to the cosmic.

6:14-16, particularly since 5:22-25 also focuses on the theme of new creation. In addition, that "new creation" in 6:15 refers to Christ is apparent from the parallel in 5:6: "For *in Christ Jesus* neither circumcision nor uncircumcision means anything but faith working through love." The positive contrast in 5:6 is parallel to the positive part of the contrast in 6:15, so that *faith in Christ Jesus* in 5:6a and 6c is parallel to, and likely synonymous with, "a new creation" in 6:15.

The result of the new creation for its inhabitants in 5:22-25 is not becoming "boastful, challenging one another, envying one another" (v. 26), a negative development of the positive attributes of the "fruit of the Spirit," particularly "peace, patience, kindness ... gentleness, self—control" (vv. 22-23). Thus, the dividing function of the "Law" has been set aside so that it cannot be "against such things" as maintaining peace in the new order (v. 23). Likewise, Gal 6:15-16 says that in the "new creation," circumcision, which stands for the dividing function of the Law (see below), means nothing, so that the effect upon those residing in the new cosmos is "peace and mercy" (6:16), a development of "peace" and "kindness" from 5:22-23 and an allusion to Isa 54:10, which I have argued for elsewhere.⁶⁹ That the reference to "peace and mercy" in v. 16 is based on Isa 54:10 should not be surprising, since Isa 54:1 has been formally cited in Galatians 4 and since the new-creation language of Gal 5:22-25 is based on, at least, Isaiah 57.

CONCLUSION

The contention of this essay is that the overall weight of the cumulative arguments about isaianic background points to the probability that Paul's reference to "the fruit of the Spirit" and its manifestations in Gal 5:22 alludes to Isaiah 57's promise (most probably together with other parallel Isaiah texts) that the Spirit would produce fruit in the new creation.

How does the evidence of our argument measure up to the now often-cited "tests" for the validity of echoes and allusions formulated by Richard B. Hays?⁷⁰

(1) *Availability to Author and Readers*. It is obvious that the book of Isaiah existed before the time of the first century A.D. in both Hebrew and Greek and that it was available in written and oral form. It

69. Beale, "Peace and Mercy upon the Israel of God: The Old Testament Background of Galatians 6,16h."

70. *Echoes of Scripture in the Letters of Paul* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989), 29-32.

is also likely that Paul expected his readers to accept his acknowledgement of Isaiah as Scripture.⁷¹

(2) Volume from the OT Background. There is explicit repetition of words and images from Isaiah, especially chap. 57. Isa 57:15-19 and Gal 5:22 are the only two places in the entire Greek tradition of both testaments where the combination of the words "Spirit," "fruit," "joy," "peace," and "patience" can be found (i.e., πνεῦμα, καρπός, χαρά [though verb form in LXX], εἰρήνη, μακροθυμία, respectively). The concept of the Spirit creating "spiritual fruit" in an eschatological era is an idea peculiar to Isaiah in all of the OT and peculiar to Galatians 5 in the NT. Augmenting this is the observation that "God sending forth the Spirit" occurs nearby in Galatians (Gal 4:6) and is uniquely similar (even in comparison to Luke 1:35; 24:49; and Acts 1:8) in all of the NT to Isa 57:16's "the Spirit will go forth from me."⁷² Therefore, that Isaiah 57 provided, at least, part of the Isaianic quarry of terms and concepts for Gal 5:22 seems to be a likely conclusion. Furthermore, there is much rhetorical stress placed on the Isaiah allusion in Gal 5:22-25, since this section is the antithesis to the "works of the flesh" in 5:19-21, which comes toward the end of the epistle and concludes the literary segment begun at 5:13.

(3) *Recurrence of the OT Text Elsewhere*. Paul shows acquaintance with the Hebrew and, especially, Septuagint of Isaiah generally. Next to the Pentateuch (about three dozen quotations), Isaiah is the second most-quoted book by Paul (at least two dozen quotations)⁷³ and is cited extensively by him.⁷⁴ Furthermore, the majority of Paul's

71. This needs qualification, which there is not space to develop here. Suffice it to say that there were likely varying degrees of awareness of the OT among the Galatian readers: (1) a small group of Jewish Christians with much awareness; (2) a group of so-called Gentile "God-fearers," who had some association with the synagogue, and thus would have significant appreciation for the OT; (3) recently converted Gentiles, who would have had not much familiarity with the OT. On a first reading, the first two groups would have picked up on a number of Paul's allusions; on subsequent readings they would have discerned more, and the third group would have begun to perceive some because they would have been disciplined on the basis of instruction in the Bible of the Church, the LXX. For elaboration on this issue from John's perspective, though with the same relevance for Paul, see my *John's Use of the Old Testament in Revelation* (JSNTSup 166; Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1998), 69-70.

72. Though we saw above that, technically, Ps 103[104]:30 is closer verbally than Isaiah 57, but its context dealt with God's preservation of the old creation. We also saw earlier that Gal 4:4, 6 is probably an allusion specifically to Isa 48:16.

73. D. Moody-Smith, "The Pauline Literature," in *It Is Written: Scripture Citing Scripture, Essays in Honour of Barnabas Lindars* (ed. D. A. Carson and H. G. M. Williamson; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 267-73. Likewise, E. E. Ellis, *Paul's Use of the Old Testament* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1991), 11-16, 150-52.

74. Out of approximately 130 allusions and parallels listed by Ellis, about 38 come from Isaiah (ibid., 153-54).

quotations come from the LXX, rarely from the MT, and when different from the LXX, they agree with no extant text or version.⁷⁵ The same statistics are true with Paul's citations of Isaiah.⁷⁶ Of most relevance in this respect, Paul cites Isa 57:19 in Ephesians 2, as well as quoting Isa 54:1 in Gal 4:27, both of which are closest to the LXX,⁷⁷ the latter being the only explicit quotation of Isaiah in the entire epistle. We have also endeavored to show that Gal 5:25 is also reflective of Isaiah 57 and that 5:5 and 5:18 are allusive references to closely related texts in Isaiah. Furthermore, the allusions to Isaiah's new-creation prophecies at the end of Galatians 5 appear to be further developed in 6:15-16 by another allusion to Isaiah, this time again from Isaiah 54. Though some might want to argue that the Isaiah 57 allusion (or echo) is too faint to be picked up, the corroborating evidence of other Isaiah allusions in the nearby Galatians context (together with the Isaiah 54 quotation) points in the other direction.

Nevertheless, it is quite possible that Paul did not have Isaiah 57 (LXX) explicitly in mind but a matrix of ideas from several Isaiah texts where the Spirit and fruit are significant factors in the coming new restoration and creation,⁷⁸ as seems to be the case in the Second Temple Jewish texts from Qumran and elsewhere that we examined. If so, this would be an instance where unique "conceptual rather than [precise] verbal correspondences" suggest that Paul has OT passages or an OT theme in mind.⁷⁹ Already in Gal 3:16 Paul has made a "collective allusion" of this sort to several very similar passages in Genesis pertaining to Abraham's "seed,"⁸⁰ and he does the same thing in 2 Cor 5:17, where he collectively alludes to the most prominent new-creation passages in Isaiah 40-66 (i.e., Isa 43:18 + 65:17, and possibly 66:22).⁸¹

75. Moody-Smith, "Pauline Literature," 272-73; and Ellis, *Paul's Use of OT*, 11-16, 150-52.

76. Moody-Smith, "Pauline Literature," 267-73, lists nine references that agree with the LXX, eight that are closer to the LXX than the MT, seven that agree with neither, one that agrees with both, but none that agrees only with the MT.

77. On Eph 2:17, see above, n. 22, and on 4:27, see Moody-Smith, "Pauline Literature," 271, who also shows that five of the ten explicit citations in Galatians either agree with the LXX or are closer to the LXX than the MT and that the remainder agree with neither or agree with both.

78. For similar argumentation about the exodus background of Romans 8, see S. C. Keesmaat with respect to Romans 8: "Exodus and the Intertextual Transformation of Tradition in Romans 8.14-30," 29-56, esp. 39-40,43.

79. Following Silva, "Old Testament in Pan]," 635 (my added brackets), who cites as an example of such a procedure Isa 53:12 ("poured out his life unto death") in Phil 2:7a ("emptied himself").

80. So Ellis, *Paul's Use of OT*, 187, who argues that (including Gen 22:18) "Paul probably had several Genesis passages in mind" here. Indeed, Gen 22:17-18 is likely uppermost in mind (see C. J. Collins, "Galatians 3:16: What Kind of Exegete Was Paul?" 7:1mBit/ 54 [2003]: 76-86).

81. As I argued in "Old Testament Background of Reconciliation in 2 Corinthians 5-7," 553-59.

(4) *Thematic Coherence*. The alleged Isaiah 57 reference (together with other Isaiah echoes) fits well into Paul's line of argumentation in Galatians 5-6. The allusions illuminate and enhance Paul's argument in that the Spirit they have received and the fruits they have begun to bear, in fact, are a beginning fulfillment of Isaiah's prophecy of new creation, new Exodus, and restoration. Thus, the Galatians are not merely Gentiles who have become Christians and received the Spirit, they are true eschatological Israelites being led by God in a second Exodus that has begun to restore the entire creation. This is not only consistent with Paul's uses of Isaiah and other OT texts elsewhere (e.g., Rom 9:24-11:27; 2 Cor 5:14-6:18) but also within Galatians (e.g., 4:27; 6:15-16), as we have already noted in part. In particular, for example, J. M. Scott has argued that Gal 4:1-7 is best read against the backdrop of first Exodus—second Exodus typology that occurs both in the OT and Judaism to portray the future restoration of Israel.⁸²

Quite similar to Scott, R. E. Ciampa has argued that in Galatians 1-2, where no OT citations occur, "Paul alludes or refers to scriptural themes, concepts, or texts"⁸³ in an informal way, expressing concepts through Scripture, much like an artist uses colors on a palette.⁸⁴ Ciampa contends that Paul designs his subtle OT references primarily to depict a new world that Christians inhabit, which is the beginning fulfillment of the prophecies of eschatological restoration. According to Ciampa, most prominent among the fulfillment themes are the prophesied second exodus, Davidic Messiah, the resurrection of the dead, the renewal of creation, a new Temple, the pouring out of the Holy Spirit and . . . other eschatological blessings.⁸⁵ Hence, "when Paul looks in the Bible to understand the church he finds his understanding in what the Bible says about (eschatological) Israel."⁸⁶ This conclusion is in line with Richard Hays's view that when Paul goes to the OT he finds there, above all else, "a prefiguration of the church as the people of God" (which Hays refers to as an "*ecclesiocentric* hermeneutic").⁸⁷ This is just what appears to be the case with Paul's allusive "fruit of the Spirit" reference, which we have argued has its source in Isaiah's new-

82. *Adoption as Sons of God*, 126-55, accepted with refinements by S. J. Hafemann, "Paul and the Exile of Israel in Galatians 3-4," in *Exile: Old Testament, Jewish, and Christian Conceptions* (ed. J. M. Scott; Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 56; Brill: Leiden, 1997), 332-49.

83. *The Presence and Function of Scripture in Galatians 1 and 2* (WUNT 2 102; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1998), 225.

84. *Ibid.*, 225-30.

85. *Ibid.*, 232.

86. *Ibid.*, 231.

87. *Echoes of Scripture*, 86, 162.

creation and restoration prophecies about end-time Israel. This is also consistent with Hays's further assertion that "Isaiah offers the clearest expression in the Old Testament of a universalistic, eschatological vision in which the restoration of Israel in Zion is accompanied by an ingathering of Gentiles," and "that is why this book is both statistically and substantively the most important scriptural source for Paul."⁸⁸

Thus, Paul's rhetorical effect and thematic emphasis is increased by the readers' being able to situate themselves, not as mere readers of past events of which they are not an integral part nor merely as Roman subjects who happen to be Christians, but as those who are part of the dawning eschatological promises made to Israel, and hence they are true Israelites who play a significant role in this cosmic redemptive-historical drama. The Galatians are no longer slaves in the captivity of sin and Satan (to which Israel's Babylonian captivity ultimately pointed), but they are "sons" restored to God in the inheritance of a new creation through their identification with Christ, the Son of God. Accordingly, their new-creational status comes through the fact that they have begun to be resurrected beings in Christ, and as such they must inevitably begin to bear spiritual fruit concomitant with a new creation. Therefore, they should not return to the idolatrous and sinful practices of the old age (for which Israel had been sent into captivity), which includes ultimate loyalty to Israel's Torah, but they should be loyal to Christ as the reality superceding the Torah. Paul has transformed the OT traditions of the new Exodus, restoration, and new creation, "so that it is no longer only the tradition of Israel, land and people, but the tradition of the whole cosmos and those in Jesus Christ."⁸⁹ This then is a plausible *satisfying* account of the effect of the intertextual relation made upon the readers (Hays's seventh "test").

(5) *Historical Plausibility*. It is probable that Paul intended to make reference to new Exodus,⁹⁰ restoration,⁹¹ and new-creation

88. *Ibid.*, 162.

89. As argued by Keesmaat with respect to Romans 8: "Exodus and the Intertextual Transformation of Tradition in Romans 8.14-30," for example, p. 46.

90. E.g., see *ibid.* Also see the background discussions of the OT and Judaism for the "Isaianic new Exodus motif" in Mark and Acts, respectively (R. E. Watts, *Isaiah's New Exodus in Mark* [Grand Rapids: Baker, 1997]; and D. W. Pao, *Acts and the Isaianic New Exodus* [WUNT 2 130; TLibingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2000]).

91. For the background of Israel's restoration in the OT and Judaism and its relevance to the NT, see again Watts and Pao, as well as: *Exile: Old Testament, Jewish, and Christian Conceptions*, ed. J. M. Scott, especially the articles by Scott, J. Neusner, and C. A. Evans; N. T. Wright, *Christian Origins and the Question of God*, vol. 1: *The New Testament and the People of God*, *passim*; and *idem*, *Christian Origins and the Question of God*, vol. 2: *Jesus and the Victory of God* (London: SPCK / Minneapolis: Fortress, 1996), *passim*.

themes,⁹² since these were pervasive motifs in the OT, Second Temple Judaism, as well as elsewhere in the NT and Paul. Therefore, Jewish-Christian readers and some Gentiles familiar with Judaism and the synagogue would have been familiar with such themes and the general OT-Jewish background from which they arose. New Gentile converts would have become familiar with these themes and texts through ongoing instruction from the OT, which was the formal Bible of the first-century church.

(6) *History of Interpretation.* We have seen that recent commentators (Hansen, Barclay, Dunn, and Silva) have briefly speculated that either Isaiah 32 or Isaiah 5 (among a few other OT passages) lay behind Gal 5:22. We will see in the following excursus that early Christian tradition identified Gal 4:4-6 (Irenaeus) or 5:19-22 (Tertullian) with the LXX of Isa 57:16 and that early Jewish tradition (*Testament of Moses*) applied the LXX of Isa 57:16 to original creation. Furthermore, it is noteworthy that S. C. Keesmaat has argued convincingly that "being led by the Spirit" in Rom 8:14, the parallel passage to Gal 5:18, is based on an Exodus—new Exodus OT background, especially Isa 63:8-16, which is what we have argued for Gal 5:18.⁹³

In this light, would it be too risky to speculate that references to "resurrection" and the "Spirit" throughout the epistle form part of a theology of new creation, which anticipates the explicit affirmation about "new creation" in the conclusion of the epistle (Gal 6:15)? Finally, if the evidence of this article has merit, then the Septuagintal tradition of Isa 57:16, which has not been part of discussions of Paul's use of the OT or of Pauline theology since the second and third centuries A.D., should be reckoned with in similar further discussions, at least in Galatians.

EXCURSUS:

THE DIVINE IDENTIFICATION OF πνεῦμα IN RELATION TO "FRUIT" IN ISAIAH 57:16ff.

While it is possible that Isa 57:16 (LXX) refers to the *divine empowerment* or breath that creates all human souls, it is unlikely that it refers to the fragility of the human "spirit," as is sometimes understood to be the case in the MT (a not-unusual translation of the MT is "for the spirit would grow faint before me, and the breath of those whom I have made" [e.g., NASB]). Possibly it could refer to the human "spirit" that

92. On which, see U. Mell, *New? Schöpfung* (BZNW 56; Berlin: de Gruyter, 1989); as well as my "Peace and Mercy upon the Israel of God: The Old Testament Background of Galatians 6,16b"; idem, "Old Testament Background of Reconciliation in 2 Corinthians 5-7"; and idem, "Old Testament Background of Rev 3.14."

93. "Exodus and the Intertextual Transformation of Tradition in Romans 8.14-30."

has been created ("comes from") by God, which is the way later Jewish interpretative tradition understood the passage: "the spirit that enwrappeth itself is from me" (so *b. Yebam.* 62a, 63b; *b. Nid.* 13b, and *b. 'Abod. Zar.*). This refers to the creation of all human bodies who will live throughout history before the messianic age, which approaches closer to the LXX notion, though the "spirit" is the human spirit, not divine. While possible, this is not a good translation of the MT for the following reasons: (1) it could be done only by translating the Hebrew **יִצְטוֹרֶה** as "enwraps itself" (i.e., the human "spirit" clothes itself with human flesh at the time of birth) rather than **ἐξελεύσεται** ("will come forth"), as in the LXX. The problem with this is that the Hebrew is a Qal imperfect form and not a Niphal or Piel, which typically carry the reflexive nuance. (2) In addition, the verb "to be" ("is") is added directly before "from me" (**מִלְפָּנַי**), which is an unnecessary and unjustified insertion. (3) In all of the Talmudic explanations, this translation presupposes a notion of the preexistence of the soul in an other worldly region (called "Guf"), from which the souls came to live on earth, when they were born and clothed with flesh, a notion not found in biblical tradition until the early church fathers.⁹⁴

Unlike this later Jewish tradition, most likely the LXX of Isa 57:16 has the divine. Spirit more specifically in mind, which is suggested by the different language used by the Septuagiritral version in contrast to the Hebrew text.⁹⁵ Like the preceding late Jewish citations, this also

94. The later Jewish text of *3 Enoch* (final redaction in fourth or fifth century A.D.) in 43:3 may quote the MT or more probably a version of the LXX (Theodotion or Symmachus): "the spirit shall clothe itself in my presence, and the souls which I have made" (on which, see further the next note below on the translation of Theodotion and Symmachus). The *Enoch* text also views "spirit" as human and applies the first clause to "the souls of the righteous which have already been created [which lived and died] ... and returned to the presence of God," and the second phrase to "the souls of the righteous which have not yet been created." Possibly *I Clem.* 59:3 alludes to Isa 57:16b, where after quoting 57:15a (God "alone is highest in the heights, resting as holy in the holies"), it calls God the "Benefactor of spirits and the God of all flesh," though this would not line up well with either the MT or LXX of 57:16b.

95. The LXX uses **ἐκρήνισται** in place of **יִצְטוֹרֶה**. The Vulgate has *egredietur* ("will go out"). Most English translations render the Hebrew "grow faint" (NASB, NIV, NRSV, ESV [English Standard Version], NETB; similarly KJV), whereas the RSV has "from me proceeds the spirit" (likewise Douay), the NEB reads "a breath of life *passed out* from me," and the Targum paraphrases with "I am about to restore the spirits of the dead." The Hebrew also could possibly be translated "will turn aside" or "will cover," on which see BDB, 742, and *HALOT* 814, the latter of which is close to the rendering of the NJPSV and Soncino Talmud (*b. Yebam.* 62a, 63b; *b. Nid.* 13b: "the spirit that enwrappeth itself is from me"), Aquila ("will compass, surround," **περιεληθήσεται**), and Symmachus and Theodotion ("will encompass," "put around," "throw around oneself," **υπτ(3)(1XE1)**). The latter set of renderings, especially the Rsv and NEB, is close to the LXX, though "spirit" is taken as human and not divine. In line with the Targum, the NJPSV and possibly Symmachus and Theodotion could refer to the human spirit clothing itself with the resurrection body as

is an interpretation of the MT but with a different meaning from both the apparent sense of the Hebrew and from the Jewish references. The use of future-singular ἐξελεύσεται enhances the probability of identifying πνεῦμα as the divine "Spirit." The exact future-tense verb form in Isa 57:16b (LXX) is used seven other times in Isaiah outside 57:16b (LXX) is used seven other times in Isaiah outside which also refer to restoration promises, where God himself (either his presence, word, law, or righteousness) is portrayed as "going forth" to create a new status for Israel and the nations (Isa 2:3; 11:1; 42:13; 45:23; 51:4, 5; the lone exception is 14:29, which is not as relevant since the unrighteous, not God, are the subject of the verb).⁹⁶ Isa 42:13 might appear to be an exception to the pattern, since it alludes to God's act of judgment. However, even in 42:13 "the Lord of hosts" who "shall go forth" does so not only in judgment but this "going forth" in context also includes his presence paving the way for restoration (42:13-16). Especially noteworthy is Isa 51:4 which has the identical construction. to 57:16: (νόμος) παρ' ἐμοῦ ἐξελεύσεται. Comparable also with Isa 57:16b is Isa 11:1, where God's eschatological agent of restoration "will come forth from the root of Jesse, and a blossom will come up from his root, and *the Spirit from God will rest* on him." Consequently, six of the seven uses of ἐξελεύσεται in Isaiah point to the identity of πνεῦμα as God's "Spirit" in 57:16, since they refer in various ways to God's presence "going forth" to restore his people. This is corroborated further from noticing that every other singular form of the verb ἐξέρχομαι where God is the subject also either refers to God's restoration of Israel or is closely associated with it.⁹⁷

If the phrase in 57:16b does *not* refer to a restoration blessing, it would be the only place where the Greek translator made a stylistic exception in using this apparently set verbal terminology with God as the subject for restoration blessing. Thus, if *nvcı5va* in this LXX passage were taken to refer to human "spirit," it would have to refer to God's new creation of the human spirit in the coming restoration.

with a garment (on which, see J. Calvin, *Commentary on the Prophet Isaiah* [Calvin's Commentaries 22; Grand Rapids: Baker, 1984], 3.215), which would continue the directly preceding and more explicit idea of resurrection expressed in the LXX and, especially the MT of 57:15b (on which, see below); Aquila and possibly Symmachus and Theodotion could well refer to the divine "Spirit" in the sense of the "Spirit encompassing" all humans who will be recreated at the end-time restoration.

96. Note in this respect also the plural use of ἐξελεύσονται in Isa 37:30-32 (Codex Alexandrinus 36^{mg} C).

97. So 28:29; 55:11; 62:1; the point of 48:3 is to refer to God's prophetic word that has been fulfilled in the past in order to indicate that his word of coming restoration will just as assuredly be fulfilled; similarly, the apparent point of 37:36 is to refer to God's ("the angel of the Lord's") deliverance of Israel from Assyria as a token of future restoration (which has just been underscored in 37:31-32).

But in view of the other uses of ἐξέρχομαι (especially ἐξελεύσεται) in Isaiah, where the verb refers to God's presence (sometimes expressed through his word or attributes), most probably πνεῦμα alludes to the coming of God's Spirit" to create anew in the restoration period (a new-creation context that is testified to also in v. 15 of the LXX, and as made even more explicit in v. 15 of the MT and v. 16b of the Targum, on which see below).

The divine identity of πνεῦμα is also supported by Isa 48:16 (κύριος ἀπέσταλκέν με [the Servant] καὶ τὸ πνεῦμα αὐτοῦ), though the verb there is not ἐξελεύσεται but a close equivalent. In addition, Ps 103[104]:30 is likewise a close OT parallel to 1.sa 57:16b and supports nVeilta being God's Spirit in Isa 57:16h: ἐξαποστελεῖς τὸ πνεῦμα σου καὶ κτισθήσονται ("you will send forth your Spirit, and they will be created"). The Psalm passage refers to God's preservation of the first creation by creating through his "Spirit" all animate beings on earth throughout history (cf. vv. 23-29). Though Isaiah appears to refer to the new creation of humans and the Psalm to the first creation of all living beings, the parallel, especially with respect to the divine identity of the "Spirit," still is significant.⁹⁹

The identification of πνεῦμα as a property unique to God's being, not the human "spirit," is even further suggested by observing that the prepositional phrase nap' t poi) in 57:16b always elsewhere in Isaiah refers to a possession of God's being, either in parallel with a statement of a divine attribute + μου or ἐμόν ("my righteousness and the salvation from me" [46:13]; "the law from me ... and my judgment" [51:41]; "the covenant from me ... my Spirit" 159:211) or in parallel expressions ("mercy from me ... the Lord is gracious" [54:101]).¹⁰⁰ The point is that, though these attributes can be shared with God's people, they have their unique origin in God as his original possession. Perhaps partly for

98. It is possible that the MT's verb should be taken this way and even that רוח refers to God's Spirit. Indeed, J. D. W. Watts opts for this in the MT itself: "For spirit proceeds before me and life-breath which I have made"; although he does not capitalize "spirit," he identifies it as God's spirit: "He gives life and it is his spirit that upholds and energizes creation" (*Isaiah 34-60* [WBC 25; Waco, TX: Word, 1987], 260-63). J. N. Oswalt admits the attractiveness of rendering the verb in the MT in line with the LXX, but he does not finally prefer it (*The Book of Isaiah Chapters 40-66* INICOT; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998, 484).

99. In the light of dating considerations of the LXX of Psalms and Isaiah, it is hard to know whether or not the Psalm precedes or comes after Isaiah, though the Hebrew form may have influenced the translator or reviser of Greek Isaiah.

100. Such parallel expressions with respect to God also occur outside Isaiah (Fick 3:17). Only four other times does the phrase nap' occur with respect to God in the LXX, all being best rendered "from me," with respect to either his word or events caused by his sovereign working in history. Surprisingly, the phrase appears only a total of 21 times in the entire LXX.

these reasons the standard Greek-English Septuagint 57:16b "for my Spirit shall go forth from me."¹⁰¹

In addition, the fact that the LXX phrase refers God's Spirit or the Holy Spirit is also pointed to by earlier Jewish and Christian exegetical tradition. The meaning of divine "Spirit" is pointed to by a Greek fragment from the *Testament of Moses* (ca. first cent. A.D.), which reads, "for . . . from the presence of God his Spirit went forth and the world came into being" (γὰρ ...ἀπό προσώπου τοῦ θεοῦ ἐξῆλθε τὸ πνεῦμα αὐτοῦ καὶ ὁ κόσμος ἐγένετο).¹⁰² The similarity of wording suggests that the fragment is an allusion to the LXX of Isa 57:16b,¹⁰³ which is significant, since it identifies πνεῦμα with God's Spirit.¹⁰⁴ The allusion in the fragment evidently refers to the creation of all beings in the old world and not in the coming new creation (as we will argue below is the case in the LXX passage), which is generally consistent with the above interpretation developed in later Judaism, except for its identification of ῥῆν Εἶρα as divine.

The identification of πνεῦμα with God's Spirit in the LXX is further confirmed by Tertullian (third cent.; *A Treatise on the Soul*, chap. xi¹⁰⁵), who also alludes to the LXX of Isa 57:16b in virtually identical fashion to the *Testament of Moses*: "My Spirit went forth from me, and I made the breath of each." Apparently different from the *Testament of Moses*, however, Tertullian explains that the last phrase specifically refers to the creation of all humanity and that the first clause mentioning God's Spirit refers to the regeneration among those of created humanity who "subdue the works of the flesh." This last phrase is an allusion to Gal 5:18-19 (those "led by the Spirit" do not do "the works of the flesh," the latter clause being unique to Galatians in all of the OT or NT).

Irenaeus (second cent.; *Against Heresies*, 5.12.2¹⁰⁶) quotes the LXX more precisely than *Testament of Moses* and Tertullian by using the

101. *The Septuagint Version of the Old Testament and Apocrypha with an English Translation* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1972), published by special arrangement with Samuel Bagster and Sons, London, and which represents Codex Vaticanus.

102. The fragment is preserved in Gelasius of Cyzicus (fifth cent. A.D.), *Collection of the Acts of the Council of Nicea II*. xxi.7, part of which is also found in Jude 9 ("Michael the archangel, disputing with the Devil"). Possibly there is allusion to Ps 103[104]:30, but the wording is closer to the LXX of Isa 57:16b.

103. The wording is even closer to the LXX when seen in the light of the preceding parallel clause of the fragment: "for from his Holy Spirit *we all were created* (πάντες ἐκτίσθημεν)," which is almost identical to the end of Isa 57:16 (πᾶσαν ἐγὼ ἐποίησα).

104. And, as observed in the preceding note, "his Spirit" is identified as "his Holy Spirit" in the prior clause of the fragment.

105. Quoted from *The Ante-Nicene Fathers* 3 (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1993).

106. Quoted from *The Ante-Nicene Fathers* 1. In *Against Hermogenes* (chap. 32), Tertullian cites the same allusion to Isa 57:16 and applies it to God's creation of the wind by his "S[s]pirit."

future tense of "come forth": "For the Spirit shall go forth from me,¹⁰⁷ and I have made every breath" (πνεῦμα γὰρ παρ' ἐμοῦ ἐξελεύσεται, καὶ πνοὴν πᾶσαν ἐγὼ ἐποίησα [for the Greek, see *TLG* of Irenaeus, *Haer.* 5.11, line 12]). Anticipating Tertullian, he introduces the Isaiah 57 citation by viewing the Spirit as doing the work of regeneration among humanity ("who tread down earthly desires") and applies this meaning to both clauses of v. 16b. In addition, directly after the Isaiah 57 quotation, he alludes to Galatians and explains that the Isaiah prophecy began fulfillment when the Spirit came on believers in the NT age: "Thus does he [Isaiah] attribute the Spirit as peculiar to God, which *in the last times* [ἐπ' ἐσχάτων (τῶν καιρῶν)] he pours forth [the Spirit] upon the human race by the adoption of sons [διὰ τῆς υἰοθεσίας]." The notion of "adopted sonship" (υἰοθεσία) occurs in the NT in direct connection to the work of the "Spirit" only in Rom 8:15, 23, and Gal 4:6 (the word appears also in Rom 9:4 and Eph 1:5 but not in direct linkage with the "Spirit"). Irenaeus, however, likely has the Galatians 4 text in focus, since only there also does the notion of "the fullness of time" (τὸ πλήρωμα τοῦ χρόνου) together with "God sending forth the Spirit" (ἐξαπέστειλεν ὁ θεὸς τὸ πνεῦμα) appear, phrases almost identical semantically to those of Irenaeus. Thus, it is noteworthy that Irenaeus equates the Isa 57:16 prophecy that "the Spirit will go forth from me" with the Galatians statement that "God has sent forth his Spirit," the latter of which he sees to be a fulfillment of the former.

Isaiah 57 explicitly mentions "fruit" in the MT (פֵּרוֹת) and in various significant versions of the LXX (καρπός). While the eclectic text of J. Ziegler's Gottingen Septuagint does not include καρπός, omitting the concluding phrase of the MT of v. 18 ("and to his mourners") and the initial clause of v. 19 ("creating the fruit of the lips"), his apparatus reveals that the versions of Aquila, Symmachus, and Theodotion include the omitted segment of the MT (with insignificant variants), including reference to "fruit" (καρπός). Aquila and Symmachus read "and I gave to him true comfort [*and*] *for his mourners, (I am the one) creating fruit* [καὶ] τοῖς πενθοῦσιν αὐτοῦ, κτιζῶν καρπός], peace upon peace to them that are far off and to them that are near" (note the alternative reading in both Aquila and Symmachus, "*and for the ones desiring* [καὶ τοῖς ποθενοῖς] him he is the one creating fruit" [καρπός]). Theodotion has essentially the same wording, though the final phrase reads "the one creating the fruit [καρπός] of the lips, peace upon peace . . ." a more literal rendering of the MT. Likewise,

107. Similarly Jerome renders Isa 57:16b as *Spiritus quoque melts, qui ex me egredietur* ("My Spirit also which from me will go out," on which, see Field's *Origenis Hexaplorum* 2.544).

number of other LXX manuscripts read the final phrase in agreement with Theodotion and the MT (so V 11' [MSS of the Lucianic subgroup] 86c-233 544 Tht.).

It appears to be more than accidental that the exact future-tense form ἐξελεύσεται of Isa 57:16 (LXX), discussed above, is sometimes also used as a metaphor of human (Gen 15:4; 38:28; 2 Chr 6:9) or botanical fertility in the Septuagint (2 Kgs 19:30-31) and especially in the book of Isaiah, where six of its seven other uses outside chap. 57 either express a metaphorical idea of botanical growth (11:1; 14:29a and 29b¹⁰⁸) or are directly associated with such an image (45:23;¹⁰⁹ 51:4, 5¹¹⁰).¹¹¹ We saw earlier that six of these seven uses also refer to restoration promises, where God (either his presence, word, or law) is portrayed as "going forth" to create a new status for Israel and the nations (Isa 2:3; 11:1; 42:13; 45:23; 51:4, 5). Somewhat comparable to Isa 57:16b is Isa 11:1-2, where "a young shoot will come forth from the root of Jesse, and a blossom will come up from his root, and the Spirit from God will rest on him." God's agent of restoration is portrayed as "coming forth" as a sprouting plant and "the Spirit from God" (genitive of source) will be upon him in the process. The following parallel line of 57:16b, "I have created [broirra] all breath," confirms that ἐξελεύσεται is part of a fertility metaphor. These uses of ἐξελεύσεται indicate, not only the divine identity of Tryci4ta in v. 16, but also the integral association of this verb with the idea of the generation of fruit as a restoration concept,¹¹² even before "fruit" (καρπὸς) is explicitly mentioned in v. 19, where the idea is developed rather explicitly through the repeated use of another technical term for creation (κτίζω) in parallel with ποιέω of v. 16b.¹¹³

108. Here the LXX uses the verb in connection with human fertility metaphors (σπέρμα and ἔκγονος) to interpret the MT's botanical images (respectively שֶׁרֶשׁ and פֶּרֶר) the second use of the verb actually being the plural form ἐξελεύσονται, which is in synonymous parallelism with the singular ἐξελεύσεται in the preceding clause, since both have the same subject in sense.

109. Compare the language of "creating the earth" and "the Lord speaking righteousness" in 45:18-19 with "righteousness will surely wine forth from my mouth" in v. 23.

110. Compare 51:3, where twice it says that God will make Israel's land like a "garden" in association with "righteousness" (v. 1), and 51:4-5, where "righteousness" again occurs, followed by a prophecy of the destruction of the old earth (51:6) in which only "righteousness" will remain.

111. Of relevance also is 37:30-32 (Codex Alexandrinus 36^{ms} C), where precisely the same picture occurs except that the plural ἐξελεύσονται instead of the singular appears.

112. In this light, it may not be coincidental that *Midr. Ps.* 104:24 directly appends to a quotation of the MT of Isa 57:19 the phrase "Thou wilt send forth Thy Spirit, they will be created" (citing Ps 104:30) and applies it to the coming "Resurrection."

113. It is difficult to know which traditions would have included both the verb ἐξελεύσεται in 57:16b and icaorrOc in v. 180, but it is quite possible that there was a "mixed

In the MT and LXX allies, the phrase "fruit of the lips" likely refers to the praise whose specific content is the following double reference to "peace," which still closely identifies "fruit" with "peace."¹¹⁴ In fact, "peace" probably implies not only the reason for praise but also the peaceful conditions and demeanor of people living in the new age.¹¹⁵

Double declarations of "peace" occur elsewhere outside Isaiah in the Greek OT (1 Chr 12:18; Hag 2:91101; Jer 6:14; 36:7; cf. Ezek 13:10, 16), but none of these is linked directly to the image of fruit. That Isa 57:18-19 portrays "peace upon peace" as a part of end-time fruit that extends beyond mere praise but includes a lifestyle and conditions of "peace" is confirmed from other texts within Isaiah: Isa 27:5 and 32:17-18. In the former passage those who say "let us make peace with him, let us make peace" are directly identified in 27:6 as restored Israelites who "will bud and blossom and the world will be filled with his fruit [καρπός]." It is perhaps not coincidental that in the midst of this passage God's Spirit (πνεῦμα) is referred to again: "did you [God] not meditate in the Spirit of harshness in order to slay them by the Spirit of wrath?" (27:8).¹¹⁶ The implied answer is that, although God "will send them away" into "captivity," he will not destroy them by his Spirit but will restore them, perhaps implying the positive work of his Spirit in doing so. This implied answer in 27:8 becomes the basis for God's forgiveness of the nation in 27:9: "Therefore, the iniquity of Jacob will be taken away," and then Symmachus and Theodotion add (following the MT), "all the fruit of the removing of his [Israel's] sin" will consist in Israel repenting of her idolatry (accordingly, compare Isa 59:20-21, where God's "Spirit" is directly linked with Israel's "turn from transgression," and Zech 12:10-14,

text" Ms that combined both, and, at the least, the two would have been associated in the combined LXX traditions.

114. Though it is possible that the phrase "creating the fruit of the lips" concludes the preceding thought of providing "comfort" to the restored people of God.

115. If Jas 3:18 is an allusion to Isa 32:17, it interprets "peace" there to be part of the metaphor of "the fruit of righteousness" (on which, see the preceding note). Likewise, Hos 14:3 (LXX) says that, when Israel "returns to the Lord," it will offer "the fruit [καρπός] of lips," and in response God will cause Israel to "bloom as the lily, and cast forth his roots ... as a fruitful [κατάκαρπος] olive tree," because from God is Israel's "fruit [καρπός] found" (Hos 14:6-9). Ps. Sol. 15:3 affirms: "the fruit of the lips with the well-tuned instrument of the tongue, the first fruits of the lips from a pious and righteous heart," which form part of "the mark of God ... upon the righteous that they may be saved" (15:6). See also Prov 12:14 and 18:20-21, which show that the phrase "the fruits of the mouth" or "of the lips" is expressive of an inner condition of character (similarly Pros' 16:13).

116. The reference to πνεῦμα here may not be to God's "Spirit" but to his "spirit" with respect to his mood of anger. The use of "Spirit" in Isa 4:4 and 28:6 is similarly ambiguous.

where God "pours out the Spirit," resulting in Israel's mourning over sin). In Isaiah 32, as we saw above, "peace" is mentioned twice to describe the spiritually fertile conditions of the Spirit-induced era of restoration.¹¹⁷

In light of all the above considerations, *Teyr,i4ta* in Isa 57:16b is to be identified with God's Spirit.

117. "Peace" also occurs twice in Isa 9:6-7 (to portray conditions of restoration brought about by Israel's future eschatological king) and in Isa 59:8 to describe those who do not know the way of peace.

G. K. Beale, "The Old Testament Background of Paul's Reference to 'the Fruit of the Spirit' in Galatians 5:22," *Bulletin for Biblical Research* 15.1 (Spring 2005): 1-38. pdf. H.D. Betz, "The Literary Composition and Function of Paul's Letter to the Galatians," *New Testament Studies* 21 (1974-75): 353-79. Clement Bird, "Brevia: Notes on Galatians v.8," *The Expositor Fourth series* 7.6 (June 1893): 471-472. pdf [This material is in the Public Domain]. David Alan Black, "Weakness language in Galatians," *Grace Theological Journal* 4.1 (Spring